DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 035 232 EF 003 845

TITLE	Study of Buffalo Schools. A Report on Educational Program, Facilities, and Finance in the City School District, Buffalo, New York.
INSTITUTION	New York State Education Dept., Albany.
PUB DATE	Nov 69
NOTE	94p.
EDRS PRICE	EDRS Price MF-$0.50 HC-$4.80
DESCRIPTORS	Budgets, *Educational Finance, *Facility Expansion, Financial Support, *Physical Facilities, *Program Evaluation, School Buildings, *School Surveys

ABSTRACT

Based on an intensive study of the Buffalo School System, findings and recommendations are presented regarding the instructional programs, staffing, and physical plant needs and fiscal problems. Separate sections contain detailed information and analyses of--(1) the instructional program at the elementary and secondary levels, (2) physical facilities, (3) comparison of appropriations with projected budget estimates, and (4) revenue for Buffalo public schools. (FS)

ED035232

STUDY OF BUFFALO SCHOOLS

A REPORT ON EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM, FACILITIES AND FINANCE IN THE CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT BUFFALO, NEW YORK

Prepared by the Staff of
the State Education Department

The University of the State of New York
THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
Albany, New York 12224

EF 003 845

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

ED035232

THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE UNIVERSITY
AND COMMISSIONER OF EDUCATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK 12224

December 6, 1967

The Honorable Members of the Board of Education
and the Superintendent of Schools of the
City School District of the City of Buffalo
Room 712
City Hall
Buffalo, New York

Dear Sirs:

On behalf of the State Education Department, it is my pleasure to transmit herewith the report of the second phase of the study of Buffalo schools. The report covers the findings and recommendations of an intensive study by a staff team from the State Education Department, conducted with the cooperation of the staff of the Buffalo School System.

In the preparation of this study, the Department also had the valuable counsel of the 15-member Advisory Committee for the Study of the Buffalo schools, headed by Mr. Ira Ross.

It is my hope that you will find this report of assistance in your continuing efforts to improve the education program and services offered by the public schools of the City. If the Department can be of further assistance to you, please let us know.

Sincerely,

James E. Allen, Jr.

Advisory Committee
FOR THE STUDY OF BUFFALO SCHOOLS

1300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, BUFFALO, NEW YORK 14222 / AREA CODE 716 886-1976

ADDRESS YOUR RESPONSE TO THIS CORRESPONDENCE TO:
Cornell Aeronautical Laboratory, Inc.
4455 Genesee Street, Buffalo, New York
November 29, 1967

Dr. James E. Allen, Jr.
Commissioner
The University of the State of New York
The State Education Department
Albany, New York 12224

Dear Dr. Allen:

Your Committee has reviewed with Dr. Woollatt, Dr. Crewson and members of your staff who worked with them their report "Study of Buffalo Schools" as submitted in final draft last week. We find it a constructive analysis of the Buffalo Public School System's instructional program, staffing and physical plant needs and fiscal problem.

Your Committee has directed me to report to you our endorsement of the Study's recommendations as necessary first steps toward meeting our city's urgent educational needs. We endorse it as well to the serious consideration of our board of education and to the ernest study of our fellow citizens. It seems to me obvious that the social and economic health of our community depends critically upon our concerted attention to the needs your staff has outlined.

Sincerely,

Ira G. Ross

Ira G. Ross
Chairman

Ira G. Ross, *Chairman*
Richard E. Moot, *Secretary*

MEMBERS
Mrs. John Bozer
Henry Ceords
Charles Diebold
Robert S. Fisk

John M. Galvin
Ambrose I. Lane
Nelson H. Nichols, Jr.
Rev. Porter W. Phillips
Mrs. William G. Pusch

Paul Schoellkopf
George R. Sherrie
W. Merle Smith, Jr.
Mary E. Wood

ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR THE STUDY OF THE BUFFALO SCHOOLS

	Name	Identification
1.	Bozer, Mrs. John (Joan)	Chairman, Education Committee Junior League of Buffalo
2.	Coords, Henry	Fisher Price Toys Vice President, Buffalo Chamber of Commerce
3.	Diebold, Charles	Chairman of the Board, Western Savings Bank
4.	Fisk, Robert S.	Dean, School of Education State University of New York at Buffalo
5.	Galvin, John M.	Chairman, Executive Committee Marine Midland Trust Company
6.	Lane, Ambrose I.	Executive Director Community Action Organization
7.	Moot, Richard E.	Attorney Ohlin, Damon, Morey, Sawyer and Moot
8.	Nichols, Nelson H., Jr.	Executive Director Buffalo Urban League
9.	Phillips, Rev. Porter W.	Pastor, Humboldt Parkway Methodist Church
10.	Ross, Ira G.	President, Buffalo Chamber of Commerce, and President, Cornell Aeronautical Laboratory, Inc. of Cornell University
11.	Rusch, Mrs. William G.	Past Council President, Buffalo PTA
12.	Schoellkopf, Paul	Chairman of the Board Niagara Share Corporation
13.	Sherrie, George R.	Vice President - Administration State University College at Buffalo
14.	Smith, W. Merle, Jr.	President, Citizens for Better Education, and Assistant Manager, Mutual Life Insurnace Company of New York
15.	Wood, Mary E. (Miss)	Executive Director, Y.W.C.A.

CONTENTS

Page

List of Tables x

The Study of Buffalo Schools xii

Summary of Findings xviii

Recommendations xix

Part I

- The Instructional Program 1
  - Population Changes and School Enrollments 2
  - Goals of the Buffalo Public Schools and the Current Dilemma 3
- Elementary Education 5
  - Organization 5
  - Administration and Supervision 5
  - Teacher Staffing 6
  - General Curriculum 6
  - Recommendations 7
- Secondary Education 7
  - Secondary School Organization and Enrollments 17
  - Pupil Goals and Achievement 18
  - Pupil Behavior 20
  - Need for Staff 21
  - Teacher Recruitment and Retention 22
  - Staff Characteristics 23
  - Administrative Organization and Procedures 24
  - Program in Grades 7, 8 and 9 26
  - Program in Grades 10, 11, and 12 of the Academic High Schools 26
  - Program in the Vocational Schools 27
  - Evening High Schools 30
  - Summer Schools 31
  - Special Programs 31

CONTENTS (continued)

Page

Part I (continued)

City-wide Final Examinations 32

Pupil Promotion and Holding Power 32

School Housing and Facilities 33

Improvement of Instruction 35

Summary of Recommendations 36

Postscript 39

Appendix 40

Part II

Facilities 41

Remodeling and Renovation 42

Vocational and Technical Education 42

Abandonment and Migration 43

Part III

Comparison of 1967-68 Appropriations with Projected 1974-75 Budget Estimates 45

Basic Assumptions for Projecting Expenditure Estimates 48

Method of Estimating Expenditures 48

Plan "A" 48

Plan "B" 50

Summary of Part III 56

Part IV

Revenue for Buffalo Public Schools 57

The Present Revenue Situation 57

Leeway Under Present Authorization 68

CONTENTS (continued)

Part IV (continued)

The Adequacy of Projected Revenue 72

Possible New Revenue Sources 74

Sources Requiring Legislative Authorization 74

Conclusion 77

LIST OF TABLES

Table Number | | Page Number

Part I

1 Age-Grade Enrollment 8

Part III

1 Professional Staffing 46
2 Summary of Building Recommendations 47
3 Summary of Budget Estimates for Education 51
4 Budget Estimates Exempt Items 51
5 Comparison of Budget Allocations 52-3
6 Analysis of Increases in Appropriations 1967-68 to 1974-75 54
7 Summary of Expenditures and Revenues 55

Part IV

1 Buffalo and Erie County Total Revenue, 1966-67 58
2 Local Revenue Raised by Buffalo Residents 58
3 Distribution of Local Revenues Among City and School Functions, 1964-65 59
4 City of Buffalo Property Tax Leeway, 1955-1968 62
5 Full Value Property Tax Rates for School and Nonschool Purposes in the Eight Largest Cities, New York State, 1965 63
6 "Big Six Cities" Approved Operating Expenditures Per Pupil in Weighted Average Daily Attendance 64
7 Sales Tax Revenues for Education - Buffalo 65
8 State Aid - Buffalo 67
9 Federal Aid Allocations 69

LIST OF TABLES (continued)

Table Number		Page Number
Part IV		
10	Authorized Local Nonproperty Taxes in New York State for Cities of 125,000 and Over	70
11	Authorized Taxes and Alternative Taxes, Possible Additional Revenue for Education	71
12	Projected Educational Revenue Comparison, Buffalo School System	73

THE STUDY OF BUFFALO SCHOOLS

Two years ago Commissioner James E. Allen, Jr. met with Mr. Anthony J. Nitkowski, then Chairman of the Buffalo Board of Education, and Superintendent of Schools Joseph Manch. The topic of discussion was the use of research resources to develop a plan for the progressive elimination of racial imbalance and for the improvement generally of the quality of education in the City's school system.

As a result the Buffalo Board of Education unanimously approved a recommendation of Superintendent Manch which was transmitted to Commissioner Allen September 22, 1965 as follows:

"The public schools of the City of Buffalo, like those in other large urban areas, have been affected by a variety of economic, sociological, and demographic changes in our society. There has been a sharp increase in the mobility of our population--from the city to the suburbs, and from rural centers to the city. The pupil population has continued to rise steadily, while the adult population has decreased, indicating larger families among the in-migrants and the effects of the increased birth rates of the 1950's.

"This shifting of population has been accompanied by definite changes in the racial composition of the city, and segregated housing patterns have been reflected in the schools.

"Over a period of many years, inadequate financing of our schools has made it impossible for us to meet the needs as they have developed, and we have made many urgent pleas for help to achieve our goal of access to the optimum opportunities in education for all children and youth commensurate with their needs as individuals. The miracle is that we have done so much with so little.

"We are now dealing with problems so critical that the remedies can not, and must not, be further delayed. The recent study by the NEA Special Committee, which has my encouragement, has pointed up many of the problems and has suggested a number of recommendations for solution.

"I would respectfully recommend at this time that we request the New York State Department of Education to join with this Board of Education in making a broad and deep study of our needs, leading to long range planning and the solution of our problems. I would further suggest that this study give special attention to such major areas of concern as school financing, racial balance, school facilities, and school staffing.

"In the meantime, we should give assurance to the citizens of Buffalo that we will continue to make every effort to achieve excellence in these and other matters on behalf of all of the children of our community. We implore our fellow citizens, and particularly those in responsible positions of leadership, to give their full support to this effort. Our children and youth need and deserve the best from all of us."

Following receipt of this statement, Commissioner Allen asked Lorne H. Woollatt, Associate Commissioner for Research and Evaluation, to formulate a procedure for developing, in cooperation with the Board of Education, a city-wide plan of action. He also stated his intention to appoint an advisory committee of distinguished citizens of Buffalo, seeking the Board's advice in this regard.

Dr. Woollatt met with the Board at which time agreement was reached concerning the general nature and timing of the study. It was to consist of two related phases. The first phase was to focus upon a plan for the progressive elimination of racial imbalance with appropriate attention to school staffing, financing and facilities, to community and legal factors to ensure that the plan was feasible, reasonable and attainable. The second phase would expand from the first and concern the general improvement of the quality of education in the schools. It would be comprehensive and pointed in regard to educational program, staff, facilities, expenditure and revenue.

The first action was the appointment of an Advisory Committee for the Study of the Buffalo Public Schools, fifteen in number, with Mr. Ira Ross as Chairman. The Committee has reviewed working documents, draft reports and recommendations. It has been a powerful resource in gearing action and recommendations to Buffalo conditions.

Early in 1966 the State Education Department contracted with the Center for Urban Education, a federally-funded, state-chartered education laboratory, to do Phase I studies. The background studies related population characteristics to the ethnic composition of the public schools; traced the history of the school system to throw light on the problems and adjustments of minority groups; described the fiscal status of the school district; and gave an overview of the organization and curriculum. From this the Center drafted a general report which was reviewed by the Advisory Committee and approved by the State Education Department before submission to the Board of Education in August 1966 as "A Plan for Accelerating Quality Integrated Education."

On November 10, 1966, the Buffalo Board of Education submitted to the Commissioner of Education its "Recommendations for Making Further Progress in Accelerating Quality Integrated Education in the Buffalo Public Schools." It accepted in principle the plan of the State Education Department and adopted sixteen specific recommendations. The report concluded:

"These proposals represent an approach to a long-range program of achieving maximum educational opportunity for all children in our schools and of making further progress in accelerating quality integrated education in the process. Certainly, the goals to be achieved are extremely worthy, even though their achievement is complicated by many factors beyond our control such as housing patterns, environmental conditions, the location and capacity of existing school buildings, financial resources, and population changes.

"The areas of financing, staffing, and facilities must still be studied by the State Education Department. Until the results of those surveys are known, it is not feasible, at this time, to make detailed recommendations involving those areas."

And so Phase II began. Its activities form the basis of the present report. The State Education Department, in cooperation with staff members of the Buffalo Public Schools, conducted a comprehensive study of the instructional program, school housing, financing, administration and supervision. The first step of the 1966-67 Phase II study was a survey of instruction. This survey, or cooperative review, was carried out under the supervision of Walter Crewson, Associate Commissioner for Elementary, Secondary and Continuing Education. Working with him were Assistant Commissioners Francis E. Griffin, Warren W. Knox, Philip B. Langworthy and Robert S. Seckendorf; Donald O. Benedict, Director of the Division of School Supervision; H. George Murphy, Chief, Bureau of Cooperative Review Service. Anthony E. Terino, Chief of the Bureau of Secondary School Supervision, and Ronald P. Daly, Chief of the Bureau of Elementary School Supervision, headed the field studies in instructional areas and prepared the instructional report--aided by more than a hundred specialists. Local leadership in this field was supplied by Superintendent Manch, Deputy Superintendent Dwight E. Beecher and Associate Superintendents Frank J.

Dressler, J. Norman Hayes, Jack L. Migliore and Bernard J. Rooney. (See Part I of Report.)

As the Cooperative Review Service survey of instruction neared completion, Herbert F. Johnson, Associate Commissioner for Educational Finance and Management Services, led his staff into a study of expenditures required to provide program, staff and facilities. William B. Haessig, Director of the Division of Educational Facilities Planning, and Basil L. Hick, Supervisor in Educational Plant Planning, made a study of building conditions, needs and trends. Associate Superintendent Rooney worked with them in this aspect (Part II). Maurice G. Osborne, Assistant Commissioner of Educational Finance and Management; A. Buell Arnold, Director of the Division of Educational Management Services; and Robert E. Wilson, Chief of the Bureau of General Educational Management Services, developed a seven-year projection of expenditures required to support the recommended program and required facilities (Part III). At the same time, John W. Polley, Director of the Division of Educational Finance, took the seven-year projection of expenditures as a basis for projecting revenue sources (Part IV). The results were reviewed by the Buffalo Administrative staff. Claude D. Clapp, Associate Superintendent for Finance and Research, represented the Buffalo staff in this study (Parts III and IV).

The coordination of reporting procedures and the production of this report have been the responsibility of William D. Firman, Assistant Commissioner for Research and Evaluation; Alan G. Robertson, Director of the Division of Evaluation; Carl E. Wedekind, Director of the Division of Research; Richard J. McCowan, Chief of the Bureau of School and Cultural Research; and Leo D. Doherty, Associate in Education Research.

At key stages the Advisory Committee made pertinent suggestions, providing those sharp insights which come from citizens about the role of education in community life.

And so the report of an extensive survey of the Buffalo Schools becomes the basis of judgments to be made by the Board of Education, the Superintendent of Schools and the people of Buffalo--a process in which the State Education Department stands ready to give continuing assistance.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The findings listed by the departmental specialists and other consultants are described in detail in the four sections of the report. The following statements incorporate some of the more serious problems which call for immediate action.

-- Changes in administration, supervision and staff procedures will be needed with the adoption of new or improved teaching methods and facilities.

-- The non-white population of Buffalo has increased from about 5 percent in 1950 to slightly over 17 percent. A large number of pupils need special instruction and costly remedial services. The public schools lack resources to deal effectively with this problem.

-- Seventy-five percent (about 19,000) of the Negro children in Buffalo schools are in school buildings where the enrollment is 75 percent or more Negro.

-- The public schools are understaffed; this is particularly true at the secondary school level.

-- There is obsolescence in educational facilities at all levels, particularly in the secondary schools.

-- The local revenue system is not geared to provide the resources which are required.

-- Projections indicate that under the present revenue pattern revenues will not be adequate to meet expenditures during the coming decade.

-- An additional 489 professional staff positions will be needed by 1974-75.

-- The provision for adequate facilities requires an expenditure of approximately $89,555,000 by 1974-75 including $57,500,000 for new construction, $19,055,000 for renovation of existing buildings, and $13,000,000 for vocational and technical education facilities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The recommendations listed by the departmental specialists are described in detail in the four sections of the report. The recommendations which follow have not been ranked but are ordered to coincide with the chapter heads of the summary report.

> The functions and duties of the supervisors of education should be reexamined; provision should be made to provide leadership for the in-service education of teachers in the areas of curriculum and instruction.
>
> Responsibility for the daily supervision of instruction within buildings should rest with the building principals. At the secondary level, department chairmen and other subject matter supervisors should be employed.
>
> The school board should accelerate its efforts to correct racial imbalance in the schools in accordance with the guidelines recommended by the study "A Plan for Accelerating Quality Integrated Education in the Buffalo Public Schools." The central administration staff engaged in planning desegregation operations should be increased.
>
> The Board of Education should continue its efforts to achieve a wider distribution of Negro teachers and administrators throughout the school system.
>
> More widespread use of State Regents Examinations should be made. The aspiration level of pupils should be developed so that more of them will aspire to the State Regents Diploma.
>
> The establishment of one or two comprehensive high schools offering general education courses, as well as courses in several vocational trades should be encouraged on a pilot basis. High school vocational courses should be examined to see whether they can be shortened. Consideration should be given to establishing vocational skills centers.
>
> Existing educational facilities require extensive renovation.
>
> A program of construction should begin at once to relieve overcrowding. This is most serious in the academic high schools.
>
> A more vigorous attempt must be made to bring more experienced teachers into the Buffalo system. Salaries should be made more attractive and the conditions of teaching improved.
>
> The secondary school teaching staff should be increased by at least 22 percent by 1974-75.

A target date of 1974-75 should be set for the completion of a comprehensive building program.

State and local municipal and school authorities must address themselves to the problem of expenditures which will in all likelihood overextend the present revenue system.

The City should levy additional authorized taxes and seek authorization of new taxes. Possibilities for additional taxes include an increase in the sales tax, a surtax on property, and a City personal income tax.

The City and the county should continue to explore a metropolitan approach to municipal and school problems.

PART I

THE INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAM

Buffalo, the second largest city of the Empire State, is one of America's major manufacturing and transportation centers. It is a city of proud traditions, rich in its contributions to the history of the nation and of the State. The home of two former presidents, it has provided opportunities for thousands of immigrants, as well as for citizens from other parts of our own country.

The public school system of the City of Buffalo is 130 years old. From the very beginning, the control of public education has been vested in the Mayor and the City Council. The Mayor appoints the members of the Board of Education. Although this seven-member body determines school policies, it is the Mayor and the Council who decide how much of the local tax dollar shall be used for schools. The amount of money that can be raised through local taxes is defined by State law.

In 1951, at the request of the Board of Education, the State Education Department conducted a comprehensive study of the Buffalo public schools. Its findings and recommendations were published in a 398-page report entitled Buffalo Public Schools in the Mid-Twentieth Century. The study pointed out that Buffalo consists of a group of subcommunities, each with its relatively homogeneous population. These subcommunities, differ widely in social, economic, and cultural characteristics.

One-third of the Buffalo inhabitants in 1950 were native-born Americans of Polish, Italian, German and Canadian origin. Only 10 percent of the total population was foreign born. Negroes comprised approximately 5 percent of the inhabitants. More than one-third of the total school enrollment was in parochial and private schools. "Back of these simple statistics," the report said, "is a complex of social conflict that has been reflected in the public schools and their management during the first half of the twentieth century. The question is whether the people of Buffalo will subordinate their social tensions to the larger role of building a city that will help children and youth to acquire those qualities that will be so greatly needed in the half of the twentieth century that lies ahead."

The changes that have occurred in Buffalo in the first 16 years of the second half of the century have not helped to alleviate its problems. Many of the commercial buildings which in 1951 were thriving with activity have fallen into disuse. Numerous business establishments, theaters and places of entertainment that once bustled with crowds have gone out of existence or are operating with less patronage.[1] While some of the city's older residents and businessmen have moved to the suburbs, the inner city, which in 1951 was relatively small, has

[1] An effort toward urban renewal has been started in one section of downtown Buffalo with the construction of a number of new, modern business buildings.

radiated outward. Radical changes have taken place in residential patterns, with poorer families moving in from other parts of the country. Buffalo's population has decreased, and its losses have been greater than that of any other of the "Big Six Cities" of New York State. Furthermore, in all of the other "Big Cities" the full valuation of taxable property has been steadily moving upward. In Buffalo, however, it has been declining each year since 1961.

The problem of providing adequate financial support for the Buffalo public schools is a long-standing one. Because of insufficient funds, the school authorities have not been able to secure the type of professional staff or to make the type of program changes required to meet the urgent educational needs of Buffalo's children and adults. Furthermore, as a result of shifts in populations, the growth of the inner city, and the changes brought on by technology, these needs have become greater and more complex. Two studies have recently been made of Buffalo's school problems, both limited in scope. One was completed in 1965 by a joint committee of the National Education Association and the New York State Teachers Association. The other was conducted in 1966 by the Center on Urban Education. The present study, conducted by the State Education Department in cooperation with the local school authorities, is the most comprehensive review of the Buffalo public schools that has taken place since 1951.

Population Changes and School Enrollments

Of the six largest cities of New York State, all except Yonkers have undergone some shrinkage in population since 1950. Between 1950 and 1960, Buffalo suffered a population loss of 8.2 percent, twice as much as that of any of the other "Big Six" cities. Between 1960 and 1966 the population decreased by 9.6 percent. The downward trend is still continuing. The non-white inhabitants, who had constituted about 5 percent of the population in 1950, have more than tripled in relation to the rest of the population and now comprise 17.43 percent of the total.

While the population of Buffalo is declining, the school enrollments are increasing. More than 23 out of every 100 Buffalo inhabitants are school children attending public or nonpublic elementary or secondary schools. In other words, of the 481,543 residents, 113,200 are school pupils. Slightly more than 73,200 of these pupils are in the public schools, while approximately 40,000 attend the nonpublic schools.

The total public school enrollments have risen by 14.6 percent since 1950. The sharpest increase has been at the secondary school level where the growth is 21.6 percent as against 10.3 percent in grades K-6.

But increased enrollments constitute only one of the problems confronting the Buffalo Public Schools. The biggest problem is the changing pupil population. The influx of white and non-white families of lower economic and educational attainment into the city has resulted in a large increase in the number of pupils who need special instruction and costly services for which the public schools are not presently well prepared and which in the past they had not been called upon to give. The white residents of Buffalo comprise 82.6 percent of the population. In the public schools, however, the white students constitute 63.1 percent of the student body, while the Negro pupils represent 34.8 percent, and other non-whites 2.1 percent.

In this city of more than 40 square miles, groups of similar cultural or national origins have traditionally tended to settle in separate sections or subcommunities. This has been true of the non-white inhabitants as well. Their children, who now comprise almost three-eighths (3/8) of the Buffalo public school enrollment, generally attend the schools nearest to their homes. Many of these schools have, therefore, acquired a predominantly non-white student body. Seventeen of the 77 regular elementary schools, 2 of the 5 junior high schools, and one of the 7 academic high schools now have a non-white enrollment of 90 percent or more.

Goals of the Buffalo Public Schools and the Current Dilemma

The Board of Education has set forth these nine attributes which the public schools should seek to develop in their pupils:

(1) a love of America and a deep appreciation of its heritage
(2) a growing and thorough command of common skills and knowledges
(3) understanding of the cultural heritage and interrelationships of the peoples of the world
(4) moral and spiritual values
(5) willingness to accept the responsibilities of individual and group living
(6) individual abilities and interests to prepare for successful vocational life, for education beyond the high school, and for enriched living
(7) an understanding and practice of the factors involved in physical, mental and emotional health, and in safe living
(8) the abilities necessary to reason clearly, to think critically, to distinguish reason from emotional appeal
(9) the knowledge, attitudes, skills, and habits necessary for active participation in the affairs of our democratic society, and a sense of responsibility for promoting American values.

These are the guideposts by which the Board, the administration, principals, teachers, and non-professional employees of the school system may periodically appraise their individual and collective efforts. While the nine objectives are sound, there is need for more emphasis on the most important goal of American education, namely, the maximum development of the talents of each pupil. The major weakness of the Buffalo schools lies in the inadequate achievement of this major objective.

An excellent statement of specific objectives, entitled Goals, Buffalo Public Schools, is prepared and published annually by the Superintendent and his division heads. In this six-page booklet, the Superintendent presents in short paragraphs a one-page list of his goals for the year. Each of the five division heads (Finance and Research, Instruction, Curriculum and Evaluation, School and Community Coordination, and Plant Services and School Planning) follows the same procedure. In this way, the professional staff and the community know exactly what the administration is seeking to accomplish during the year.

Buffalo is a city that has undergone great transformations--transformations which have multiplied the problems of every branch of the city government. To maintain necessary services, each agency has had to press for more funds. In Buffalo, the school system is a department of city government. When tax money is divided, the school budget requests are weighed against the needs of other city departments.

Increasingly difficult educational problems have developed with the changing population. The newer inhabitants have moved to Buffalo largely because of economic, technological, and social developments in the states and communities from which they came. This raises the question as to whether the responsibility for providing an adequate school program should continue to depend upon the city and State alone, or whether more of the burden should be assumed by the Federal government.

ELEMENTARY EDUCATION

Organization

Generally, the elementary schools are located to serve neighborhoods with grade-level arrangements which vary from K-4, K-5, K-6, and K-8. In general, elementary classes are organized on traditional grade level patterns, although non-gradedness has been established on a limited basis. Principals have considerable authority to organize classes heterogeneously or homogeneously in terms of educational needs. A conscious effort has been made to plan reasonable class sizes. Citywide average class sizes are 27.1 for kindergartens and 27.8 for grades 1-6.

A clear-cut policy exists regarding entrance age for kindergarten. To be admitted a child must be 5 years old on or before December 31.

Analysis of age-grade data shows that Buffalo has succeeded in reducing overageness since the last survey by the New York State Education Department in 1950-51. It is only at the sixth grade level that overageness is excessive.

Half-day kindergartens are provided for 5-year-old children. An inequity of time exists between the forenoon sessions of 2 hours and 40 minutes and the afternoon classes of 2 hours and 10 minutes. The school day is 5 hours for the primary and 5 hours and 20 minutes for the intermediate grades. Lunch periods vary in length to accommodate the children in the separate schools.

Standardized achievement, mental ability, and State tests are used regularly. Citywide tests are given in June in grades 4-6 in reading, English, spelling, mathematics, social studies, and science. It is contemplated that the citywide tests for grade 4 will be discontinued this year.

Cumulative records of individual pupils are well kept. In some of the schools visited, however, testing data and other information are not used to best advantage in planning instruction.

All of the elementary schools use report cards and some of the schools augment this type of reporting pupil progress with parent-teacher conferences. The major ways in which school programs are interpreted to the public are through bulletins to parents, open houses, parent-teacher meetings, assembly programs, and parent visitation days.

Parental approval is required for admission to special classes which are provided for gifted pupils in grades 5 and 6 with IQ's of 130 or higher. Provisions are made for those with mental and physical handicaps. Some children from socio-economically depressed areas are bussed to schools outside their own attendance areas where more facilities and services can be made available to them.

Administration and Supervision

Under the direction of the Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education and the Director of Elementary Education, a corps of ten supervisors of elementary education with broadly defined functions work in the schools.

These functions focus upon the improvement of instruction through leadership responsibilities in research, inservice education, evaluation and experimentation. The supervisors also serve as resource persons with respect to methods, materials, and equipment, and they visit and maintain close liaison with the principals and teachers. Each supervisor is held responsible for orientation and inservice meetings at a particular grade level. Six supervisors are each responsible for a particular skill or subject area.

Currently, the supervisors are working mainly with temporary and probationary teachers, in many cases on a one-to-one ratio. They also assume administrative duties in the schools during the absences of the principals.

The elementary school principals and their assistants are a capable group of administrators. A few of the annexes are administered by assistant principals or head teachers. The ultimate responsibility, however, rests with the neighborhood building principal. The elementary school principals and supervisors of elementary education meet regularly in citywide inservice programs. For the 28 schools in the sample, competent and generally adequate clerical services are provided.

Teacher Staffing

On the basis of the sample schools, Buffalo has an experienced elementary teaching staff. Two-thirds of the teachers have four years or more of experience. Thirty-nine percent of the teachers have 11 or more years of teaching. Eighty-three percent of the teachers are fully certified, 10 percent are working toward certification, and 7 percent are either not certified or are teaching out of license. Sixty-five percent of the teachers hold bachelor's degrees; twenty-three percent have earned master's degrees or above; twelve percent of the teachers have not completed degree programs.

Buffalo reported 6,263 half-day kindergarten pupils under the instruction of 115.5 teachers for an average class size of 27.1. There are 34,640 pupils in grades 1-6 who are taught by 1,247 classroom teachers for an average class size of 27.8. In addition, there are 1,280 handicapped children in special classes under the instruction of 105.5 teachers. Special teacher services, largely in the intermediate grades, are provided in physical education, music, and art. Reading teacher services are provided in 16 schools and the reading center. School librarian services are provided only in the five K-8 schools. Three helping teachers work in three schools. Home instruction is provided as needed. In a few K-8 schools, small amounts of special teacher services were reported in home economics, industrial arts, swimming and foreign languages. Speech-correction services are provided in all schools.

General Curriculum and Instruction

Buffalo has developed a considerable amount of curriculum material organized around the broad areas of learning as recommended by the State. Currently, the central office is updating the local curriculum according to recent State publications. The instructional program, however, tends to be textbook-centered with respect to content and traditional in terms of teaching practices. This reflects the budget deletions year after year which have denied the facilities, personnel, educational equipment and instructional materials essential to developing quality education for every elementary child.

Where adequate funds have been available to individual schools and for special services and programs, the Buffalo schools have demonstrated their abilities to develop superior programs. E.S.E.A., Title I funds have helped in the development of remedial and enrichment programs through PLUS and SPAN. A special program for physically handicapped children at School No. 84 has provided remedial guidance and medical services. A unique feature of the project is the inclusion of a group of preschool physically handicapped children during the summer of 1966. E.S.E.A., Title I funds have been used to improve instruction through teacher aide services and inservice programs. During the summer of 1966, E.S.E.A. funds made possible the development of Teacher Guides in several curriculum areas for use in the Target Schools. EARLY PUSH, established in April 1966, was designed to bridge the gap between the cultural environment of the children and the demands they would encounter in the primary classroom. Cultural enrichment programs, developed with E.S.E.A. funds, have greatly improved the education of those pupils included in such projects as SPAN, CURTAIN CALL, CONCERTS AND RECITALS, to name a few.

E.S.E.A., Title II funds have been used to increase book and film libraries in the Target Area Schools. Other notable projects developed with E.S.E.A. funds are HORIZON and the DEMONSTRATION CENTER (School 28) for teachers of the Mentally Handicapped. Equally commendable is the DEMONSTRATION SCHOOL, No. 12 which was initially funded with the assistance of the Ford Foundation. This school serves also as an inservice center for non-contract teachers.

Buffalo is to be complimented for its extensive program of special classes for mentally handicapped children. The programs for physically and emotionally handicapped children and the hearing class program which serves not only the City of Buffalo but also provides special classes for children from neighboring districts are also commendable.

Recommendations

1. In schools where the pupils are placed in graded classrooms with one teacher, class enrollments normally should not exceed 25 pupils for grades K-3 and 27 pupils for grades 4-6. Opportunities for individualizing instruction increase as class sizes are reduced below these enrollments. In schools where the pupils are placed in nongraded, team teaching instructional units, a ratio of one classromm teacher to every 25 pupils is desirable.

   In either graded or nongraded schools, enrollments should be large enough to justify the full-time assignment of special personnel in library education, corrective reading, physical education, music, art, and school-nurse services. Schools of 600-800 pupils justify full-time services in these areas.

Where elementary pupils are housed in middle and K-8 schools, the secondary school organization should not be imposed upon them. To illustrate, a middle school may house grades 5-8. Rather than departmentalizing grades 5 and 6, team teaching has been found effective. This type of instructional organization makes possible a unified grade 5-8 program and effective utilization of special personnel.

2. Buffalo has succeeded in reducing much of the overageness of elementary pupils since 1950, which is commendable. A need exists, however, for continued review of promotional practices as indicated by the following:

   Approximately 7 percent of the sixth-grade pupils in the 28 school sample are overage. The needs of these pupils and all other average sixth-graders in the city should be reviewed with respect to program adaptations and grade placement adjustments. With few exceptions, children ages 13 years and over, as of September 30, should be placed in the junior high school as a matter of policy and good education. It follows that appropriate instructional adaptations would be needed in the early secondary school years.

   The chronological age range of any grade should not usually exceed 3 years. The data for the 28 sample schools show, however, some overageness at all grade levels.

Table 1

Age-Grade Enrollment (September 1967)

Grade	Age										
	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14
Kdg.	789	1827	28	4	1						
1st		684	1790	280	21						
2nd			395	1512	313	17	2	1			
3rd			1	439	1528	383	49	1			
4th					398	1521	434	45	3		
5th					14	398	1395	430	84		
6th						2	296	1320	437	160	5

3. Kindergarten pupils on half-day sessions should receive a minimum of 2½ hours of daily instruction. The afternoon classes are now in session for only 2 hours and 10 minutes. This time inequity can be corrected by lengthening the afternoon classes, or reversing the forenoon and afternoon sessions at midyear. Long range planning should provide for full-day kindergarten sessions.

4. Buffalo supports a good testing program in terms of providing data for pupil achievement and progress on a citywide and individual school basis. Results of the testing program should be used more estensively by principals and teachers to plan classroom instruction and corrective teaching for individual pupils.

5. At the beginning of the school year, all teachers should familiarize themselves with the academic, health, and physical development records of each child. Periodic review of pupils' records will alert teachers to any changes noted by the nurses and principals.

6. Attention should be given to the security of pupil records in all schools. The microfilming program is a step in this direction.

7. Parent-teacher conferences should be an integral part of reporting pupil progress in all schools. This is also a recommendation submitted in the local Summary Report.

8. The functions and duties of the supervisors of elementary education should be reexamined. Essentially, supervisors should work with teacher groups of all experience levels. This approach would permit the supervisors to function as defined in the central office job description as amended in December 1963. More specifically, the supervisors should continue to assist and provide leadership for inservice education of teachers which is directly related to developments in curriculum and instruction. Another broad function of the supervisors should be the dissemination of the latest research findings as they relate to the improvement of instruction. Since most of the supervisors carry a specialty in a skills or content area, they can contribute significantly to the knowledge and techniques of all teachers through leadership in grade level and subject matter meetings, workshops and seminars. In general, teacher groups with whom the supervisors work should represent several schools. Furthermore, as experienced and highly capable supervisors, they could help more to strengthen the supervisory practices of principals and assistant principals.

9. The day-to-day supervision of instruction within the separate schools should continue to be the direct responsibility of the principals. To carry out this responsibility requires that each principal develop a supervisory plan that includes (a) supervision of teachers in groups, and (b) supervisory assistance to individual teachers.

    a. An instructional committee is one way of organizing for effective supervision of teachers in groups. The committee, working with the principal, could deal with instructional problems unique to its own school--ways of implementing revised curriculum areas; identification of instructional problems within specific subjects; determination of areas of priority for study and ways of studying them. Individual committee members can facilitate communication within the school because they are in class liaison with other teachers as well as with the principal.

Other teacher groups have important roles in the supervisory program. Grade level, multiple-grade and team teaching groups can deal effectively with the day-to-day problems of teachers. In these groups, the teachers can be given opportunities to share experiences, plan together and study problems of mutual concern. Vertically organized committees are recommended for the study of special problems, such as the uses of test data and the development of guides for parent-teacher conferences. Chairmen of teacher groups and committees may be drawn from the membership of the instructional committee.

b. The principal is responsible for planned classroom observations which are the basis for providing individual teachers with supervisory assistance. Through these observations the principal and his assistants can become acquainted with those unique problems confronting individual teachers. These problems can often be solved by working with individual teachers in conferences. The principal and his assistants should be available upon request for classroom visitations and teacher conferences.

10. Buffalo employs assistant principals in elementary schools with 25 classroom teachers or 700-750 pupils. An additional assistant principal is assigned for every additional 15 classroom teachers. Day-to-day supervisory needs may justify assistant principals in some elementary schools with 20 classroom teachers or 500-600 pupils. A ratio of one clerical position to every 500 pupils is considered adequate.

11. Budgetary provision should be made for the staff development of central office supervisors, building principals and assistant principals. Membership in professional organizations is the responsibility of the individual supervisor and administrator. It is the function of the central office, however, to encourage and support participation in these organizations. Thus, funds should be continued and increased for attendance at regional workshops and State and national conferences. A practical plan would be to budget for such attendance on a rotating basis.

12. Increased provision should be made to have individual staff members and groups visit and study newer programs and organizational patterns developing in New York State elementary schools. Currently, visitations to schools involved in implementing the new State curricula in reading, language arts, mathematics, science and social studies would be appropriate. Also, visitations and study of what other elementary schools are doing with respect to programs for the educationally disadvantaged and the gifted are recommended. Principals and key teachers would also benefit by observing ways of differentiating instruction which are being developed in the better nongraded, team teaching situations.

13. Efforts to reduce kindergarten class sizes should be continued. To illustrate: with present enrollments, only ten more teachers would be needed to reduce the average class size from 27.1 to 25. With twenty more teachers the majority of kindergarten classes would range from 20-25 pupils, with an average of twenty-three pupils.

14. On a citywide basis Buffalo has achieved a satisfactory average class size for grades 1-6. A problem exists only in the relatively few classes which enroll 30 pupils or more. Class size ranges of 23-25 pupils for grades 1-3 and of 25-27 pupils for grades 4-6 are recommended for future planning.

15. Buffalo has made considerable progress in providing special teacher services in physical education, music, art, and speech. The need is to extend services in physical education, music and art to all of the primary grade classes. Also, the services of school librarians are needed.

16. The elementary schools should strive for a better balance of men and women teachers for the intermediate grades. Buffalo should recruit a balance of experienced and beginning teachers, many of whom should come from outside the Greater Buffalo area.

17. A major need at the classroom level is the availability of a greater variety of teaching and learning materials. Among those most needed are pupil research materials, such as reference and supplementary books in all content areas. Other reference materials needed are children's magazines; pamphlets; encyclopedias; atlases; dictionaries; and filmstrips and recordings in social studies, science and health. The provision of these and other materials in content subjects would encourage teachers to develop ways of differentiating instruction, such as are found in unit teaching.

18. Improvement in the teaching of the content subjects could be realized by the provision of other types of educational equipment and materials. Appropriate maps and globes are needed in many classrooms. Science supplies and equipment are needed in each of the unit areas. Manipulative devices for the teaching of mathematics are especially needed in the primary grades.

19. If a greater variety of educational materials and equipment were provided, improved instruction in all classrooms would result. Many teachers will need considerable assistance to learn the uses of these materials and to develop new teaching techniques. To accomplish this, inservice education and supervision can be highly effective and is a responsibility which rests primarily with the building principals and their assistants.

20. Two major recommendations are offered for the continued improvement of reading instruction: (a) assignment of reading teacher specialists to the schools on a ratio of one teacher to every 800 pupils; and (b) provision of funds for the purchase of supplementary, cobasal and library materials.

21. Since essential materials for language arts instruction are limited, it is difficult for teachers to implement the total program and to adapt all subjects and facets of language arts to the individual needs of the pupils. Immediate attention should be given to composition, listening and speaking, and the speech problems of children coming from disadvantaged backgrounds.

22. The remedial program in mathematics has received Department commendation. This program and mathematics instruction in general can be further improved by the provision of larger quantities and a greater variety of concrete, manipulative materials. These materials are needed to supplement the basic textbooks.

23. In some schools, up-to-date science textbooks are in short supply. There is a general lack of science equipment and supplies for teacher demonstrations and pupil experimentation. Science library resources, such as books, pamphlets, magazines and films, are limited and must be supplied if science instruction is to be improved.

24. Project Opportunity in four elementary schools has involved teachers in the uses of many types of audiovisual materials. This approach, if extended to all of the schools, would strengthen the total program. Additional resources, such as reference materials, would help teachers to develop many other types of learning experiences geared to the varying abilities of the children.

25. Health education is an integral part of the elementary school curriculum. It must, therefore, be given the same attention in terms of planning and instruction which is provided for the other areas of learning.

26. Long-range planning should include the provision of facilities to offer instructional periods of physical education for all elementary pupils. Periodic safety appraisals of all outdoor and indoor facilities and equipment should continue to be routine. The involvement of physical education teachers in these appraisals should continue.

27. Buffalo should be commended for initiating an elementary school foreign language program. The program would be strengthened by: (a) maintaining the policy that foreign language instruction is optional; (b) providing curriculum guides or outlines to the teachers; (c) offering sequential instruction through grade 12 in those languages which are taught in the elementary grades; and (d) continuing instruction by television and (e) limiting instruction to two foreign languages.

28. The dropping of music specialists for grades 1-3 has seriously handicapped the music program. In these early formative years children shape and acquire attitudes, basic skills and understandings. The neglect of music instruction in the primary grades causes a large proportion of children to fail to learn how to coordinate their singing voices. They remain "nonsingers" or "out-of-tune singers" throughout their school years and possibly throughout their lives. Lack of training in reading readiness and in sight reading of music give the pupils a serious handicap for later achievement in music. This handicap is reflected and readily observed in the vocal music programs in the junior and senior high schools of the Buffalo system.

    The limiting of vocal music instruction in the intermediate grades to one 30-minute period per week precludes the possibility of satisfactory achievement in music for children in these grades. The State Education Department guidebook, Children, the Music Makers, recommends six areas of musical experiences and activities namely, singing, listening to music, moving to music, playing instruments, creating, and reading music. In a 30-minute period each type of activity can receive only an average of 5 minutes per week. It is impossible for any teacher to achieve satisfactory results under these restricting circumstances. Music instruction by music teachers should be provided in grades 1-6 in all schools.

    The instrumental program should be extended to all interested pupils in the intermediate grades, which will require more school owned instruments and more teachers.

    As part of the long range planning to extend vocal and instrumental music instruction, it would be well first to serve the Target Area schools.

29. Art instruction should be provided by art teachers in grades 1-6. Curriculum related art work in the classrooms would be improved by closer liaison between the classroom teacher and the art specialist. As budgetary support increases for art instruction, consideration should be given first to the Target Area schools.

30. Efforts to correct racial imbalance should be accelerated. Consideration should be given to a wider distribution of Negro teachers and administrators throughout the school system. Expansion of the experimental program known as "Project SIT-UP" to include schools in danger of becoming de facto segregated is recommended. Some schools on the fringes of the Target Area have needs as great as those in the Target Area. The Community Relations Office should be staffed with at least two more professionals, one of whom should be assigned full-time work in the area of intercultural relations in elementary education.

31. Building plans should include classroom facilities for mentally retarded children of 5 and 6 years of age.

Improved scheduling of special service teachers should be planned so all mentally retarded children will be assured of special subject instruction. The present building for the trainable mentally handicapped is highly desirable. Additional space is needed, however, to implement other desirable aspects of program expansion.

32. Programs for physically and emotionally handicapped children may be strengthened by implementation of the following administrative provisions: (a) separate funds in the budget for home teaching instructional materials; (b) central filing system of pupil records; (c) continuing census of all physically handicapped children in the city; and (d) special facilities for access by orthopedically handicapped children.

33. The programs for physically handicapped children can be further improved through the provision of more manipulative instructional materials, the expansion of classes and programs for perceptually handicapped children, the provision of more psychological testing to assist classroom teachers in diagnosing learning defecits and the encouragement of preschool experience at the Rehabilitation Center for all physically handicapped children. The provision of special transportation for health classes at P.S. 18 would eliminate lengthy time periods on the buses.

34. Major recommendations relative to continued improvement of programs for emotionally disturbed children are: (a) direct screening procedures toward specific classroom program planning with attention directed toward obtaining a thorough psycho-educational assessment of each child's learning abilities and disabilities along with elaboration of a program of management and therapeutic learning experiences; (b) initiation of a broader range of services to include such services as special classes, "crisis teachers," and more effective utilization of pupil personnel services; (c) establishment of a systematic form for teacher reports; (d) involvement of the school psychiatrist in the program for a greater period of time and provision for teacher access to the psychiatrist through periodic case conferences; and (e) reconstitution of the advisory committee with fewer members. Psychologists and classroom teachers should be represented on the committee.

35. Policy should be developed regarding intake of hearing handicapped children into the class based upon the type of program provided to the hearing handicapped child. Children should be admitted to the program on a trial basis to determine if they are able to develop adequate language and speech in order to progress academically in the integrated program. In order to determine if progress is possible, integration on an individual basis should begin at the first grade. Hearing-handicapped children should be integrated in regular school programs and activities. Standardized achievement tests should be utilized to determine at what levels the children are performing. The hearing-handicapped child not able to develop adequate language and speech or who has other physical and mental problems preventing

integration should be provided a separate program. Referrals to other school programs for the deaf, emotionally disturbed or mentally retarded should be considered. The placement, referral and termination of children in the conservation of hearing program should be decisions based upon administrator and teacher experience with the child in the school. Annually, teachers should be provided with an audiogram on each child and also the speech reception threshold with both aided and unaided responses being given. This information should be explained in a meaningful way to the teachers as part of the clinic report. The auditory equipment should be evaluated in terms of amplification and receive more attention relative to maintenance. Primary classes should be grouped together, so that the teachers may have daily contact and communication regarding the children. Grouping of the other classes in separate schools must provide integration possibilities and provisions for industrial arts, music and supervision. Consideration should be given to the establishment of a kindergarten class for hard-of-hearing children.

36. The speech-correction staff should be increased to provide one teacher for every 75-100 pupils in need of this service. Rooms used for speech-correction work should be redesigned and equipped for this service.

37. Additional funds are needed to provide each elementary school with the essential educational communications equipment and materials. Needs can be determined by a survey of available equipment and materials relative to condition, uses, up-to-dateness, quantity and availability to classrooms and teachers. On the basis of such inventories, future needs can be projected and purchases planned over a period of years. This type of survey and long-range planning should indicate those media which can best be distributed from a central unit and those educational communications items which should be placed in separate schools and classrooms.

38. Long-range planning should provide for central libraries with appropriate book collections and supplementary materials in each elementary school. The planning should include staffing school libraries on the basis of one librarian to every 500-750 children. To carry out the staffing recommendation, it is suggested that 10 school librarians should be appointed immediately. An additional 10 school librarians should be added yearly, until the recommended ratio is attained. The school librarians, in cooperation with the supervisor of libraries, will be able to establish good library services in the schools to which they are assigned. The purchase of library books should be increased gradually from the present per-pupil allocation until a $3.50 annual expenditure is realized.

39. Further improvements in the school lunch program may be realized by the following: (a) placing greater emphasis upon the nutritional values of good eating patterns; (b) correlating the school lunch program with instructional areas, such as health, science and other related subjects; (c) including more fresh fruits and raw vegetable relishes in the menu;

(d) informing parents, teachers and pupils of future menu offerings; (e) planning for the maintenance and replacement of equipment, the renovation of facilities and employment of needed additional personnel; (f) clarifying custodial staff responsibilities in relation to food services; and (g) making a study of the types of work performed by personnel in the school lunch office. As a result of this study, some responsibilities might be delegated to the finance or other offices.

SECONDARY EDUCATION

Secondary School Organization and Enrollments

The public secondary schools of Buffalo, with a total enrollment of 31,019 pupils, are serving roughly 65 percent of the total secondary school population. The other 35 percent attend the 24 nonpublic secondary schools located in the city.

The secondary school pupils are taught in 59 different buildings, as follows: 7 academic high schools, 7 vocational high schools (including the Hutchinson Technical High School), 5 junior high schools (grades 7, 8, and 9), 5 seventh and eighth grade centers, seventh and eighth grade classes in 30 different elementary schools, and 5 very small schools for pupils presenting special problems or handicaps.

While the overall public secondary school enrollment has grown by 21.6 percent since 1950, in the vocational schools it has increased by 37.1 percent. No substantial increase in total secondary school enrollment is anticipated, however, during the next ten years.

While seventh and eighth grade classes are located in 35 different elementary schools, much improvement has taken place since 1951, when these classes were spread out in 70 different buildings, many of which did not have sufficient enrollment, staff and facilities to provide a secondary school program that met State requirements.

The 1951 survey report recommended that Buffalo "bring together, under separate administrative leadership, larger numbers of early adolescents in grades 7 to 9," using existing facilities where possible. The report added: "This might result in some units of grades 7 and 8, some of grades 7, 8, and 9 and some of grades 7-12. While 600 to 1000 pupils is generally recommended for such a unit, it would appear preferable that no unit have less than 300 pupils. Class size might well average 30."

Because of changes in pupil population in Buffalo and the need for more specialized services at the early secondary school level, some recommendations in the 1951 report are no longer appropriate. For example, an average class size of 30 is much too high, and the Buffalo school administration has been wise to recommend smaller classes. In the academic subjects, most classes should not exceed 25 pupils, and for slower or remedial pupils, classes of 15 or 20 should be provided.

The recommendation that no seventh and eighth grade schools have an enrollment of less than 300 pupils has been fulfilled only in two of the K-8 elementary schools. In fact, 70 percent of the K-8 schools have less than 200 pupils in the grades 7 and 8. As a result of the small enrollment, the secondary program in these schools suffers. Even a 300-pupil unit in the secondary school grades is now too small to provide strong, full-time specialists in each curriculum area. The present recommendation is approximately 200 pupils per grade. Furthermore, the 1951 suggestion that existing older buildings be used to house junior high school or seventh and eighth grade units must be weighed with a great deal of caution.

The use of old buildings originally designed for other purposes is likely to present disadvantages, especially in the depressed areas of the city.

In one respect, the Buffalo public school authorities have accepted and even gone beyond the 1951 recommendations. They have created five junior high schools of optimum size, four of which are in new, well-equipped modern buildings designed expressly for junior high school use, while the fifth occupies an old building that was formerly used as a technical high school. The latter school is experiencing some serious problems which may be due to the location and age of the building, as well as to other factors.

As a means of providing greater instructional services not only in the early adolescent years but also in the upper elementary school grades the board of education has recently accepted, in principle, the "middle school" concept, and a pilot "middle school" is planned for 1967. The present junior high school buildings are so designed that they can readily be converted into "middle schools." Additional high school rooms will be needed, however, to provide for the ninth grade classes presently housed in the junior high schools.

Pupil Goals and Achievement

The public secondary schools of Buffalo serve pupils of many different religious, social, economic, cultural and ethnic backgrounds. A large number of these boys and girls win distinction for scholastic excellence and for school service. Several years ago, the pupils in one high school placed fourth in a national high school mathematics contest involving more than 200,000 pupils from 6300 schools in the United States and Canada. Another school can point with pride to the fact that, within a single five-year period, 16 of its alumni earned doctorate degrees. Examples of superior accomplishments are too numerous to mention.

A large percentage of Buffalo pupils come from homes where books, periodicals and other educational materials are abundantly available. At the other extreme, there is an increasing percentage of pupils who cannot or do not receive strong assistance and encouragement either at home or among their peer groups. Many of these pupils are indifferent toward school or show low levels of achievement. While the problem of school under-achievers and non-achievers occurs to varying extents in all communities, it is more pronounced in large urban centers. The extent to which it exists in Buffalo is evidenced by the scores on the ninth grade reading and arithmetic competency tests administered in 1965 in all the schools of the State. Fifty percent of the ninth grade pupils in the Buffalo public schools achieved a raw score of 23 in the reading test, while in the State as a whole, 60 percent of the ninth grade public school students attained this score or higher, and in Erie County 66 percent. In the arithmetic tests, the score achieved by 50 percent of the public school pupils of Buffalo was reached by 58 percent of the public school pupils in the State, and 62 percent in Erie County. The average scores in the Buffalo public schools were therefore markedly lower than those in the public schools of the State and of the County.

Although the Buffalo public schools have twice as many secondary school pupils as the nonpublic schools, they win only half as many Regents scholarships. The nonpublic schools, of course, offer mostly college preparatory courses and therefore enroll and retain pupils who have the basic skills and motivation to pursue academic studies, while the public schools must accept and provide instruction for pupils of widely different abilities and goals.

Consequently, test scores and comparative scholarship data should not be used to judge the quality of instruction in the Buffalo public schools in relation to that of other schools, for the differences in pupil population do not provide a valid basis for comparison. What these data do point up, however, is (1) that Buffalo, like other cities, has a larger percentage of educationally disadvantaged secondary school pupils than the average community, and (2) that the Buffalo public secondary schools must make enormous, extraordinary efforts to give these pupils a better command of the basic skills.

The solution is not so easy as it sounds. It is not simply a matter of having teachers drill the less able pupils in reading and arithmetic. The attack must be on all fronts, for it is the "whole person" that must be taught. The Superintendent of Schools summarized one major aspect of the problem when he said: "The Buffalo schools must try to meet needs unique to a large city and needs which are above average in their demands upon financial and personnel resources, with support which is dangerously below average...Programs for culturally disadvantaged and handicapped pupils cost two to five times as much as regular programs." While the Superintendent emphasized staff and financial needs, there also remains the question of acquiring sufficient wisdom and "know-how" to do the job, for the uniqueness and unprecedented immensity of the task represent nothing less than a new frontier in American secondary education.

Forty-five percent of the boys in the public high schools of Buffalo are attending the vocational schools. Of the entire student body of boys and girls in grades 9-12, approximately half are enrolled in so-called "vocational education courses," which include not only the trade and technical programs offered in the vocational schools, but also the business education courses given in the academic high schools. A large number of other pupils are taking terminal courses of a non-vocational type. With this heavy preference for business, vocational, and terminal programs, the number of pupils taking academic courses leading to college or post-high school education constitutes a smaller percentage of the total high school enrollment.

The percentage of Buffalo public high school graduates who continue their education is below that of the other "Big Six" cities and below that of most other New York State school systems. Of the 1966 graduates, 41.9 percent went on to further education, while in the other "Big Six" cities the percentage ranged from 44.7 to 68.0 percent. Buffalo, with a public school enrollment of 20,000 pupils in grades 9-12, turned out approximately 4000 high school graduates in 1966. Of these, 1041 entered college, while 411 others entered two-year post high school institutions.

For many years, Buffalo had required all high school pupils to pass the Regents examinations in order to gain promotion. The report of the 1951 survey, however, recommended that this rigid requirement be discontinued, since the Regents "are intended to be used only as a partial measure of achievement for the more able pupils." In implementing this recommendation, Buffalo has swung too far in the opposite direction. Now the Buffalo schools urge only the "honors" pupils to take Regents. Since these State-wide tests are generally harder, contain more thought questions, and involve more restrictive marking procedures than local tests, many pupils prefer to take Buffalo's city-wide examinations.

The de-emphasis of Regents examinations in Buffalo has led to a similar de-emphasis of the State Regents High School Diploma. For the State diploma, a pupil must complete 18 units of credit and must pass Regents examinations in English, American history and world history, and a three-year sequence in an elective subject. The local diploma, however, requires only 16 units and does not call for any Regents credit. In June 1966, only 12 percent of the Buffalo graduates received State Regents High School Diplomas as against a range of 31 to 38 percent for the other "Big Six" cities, exclusive of New York City. (The New York City schools issue, instead of the State diploma, a Diploma with Regents, which requires not only the passing of Regents examinations, but also more elective sequences than the State diploma.)

The fact that a minimal number of pupils take Regents examinations or earn State diplomas, along with the heavy enrollment in vocational and other non-academic subjects suggests that the Buffalo public secondary schools need to raise their own level of aspiration with respect to pupil abilities and, above all, need the financial support and resources to carry out this task. Confronted with an educational challenge of unprecedented difficulty, the Buffalo schools have had to carry on with inadequate staff, poor facilities, and insufficient supervisory help. The questions need to be faced frankly: Are these schools providing Buffalo with leadership or followership? Because of the difficulty of doing otherwise, are too many pupils being permitted to settle for short-range goals that do not challenge their real talents? Does Buffalo's present policy regarding Regents examinations reflect a weakening of its determination to make each pupil as proficient as he can be? The answers to these questions have great significance for the future of the city.

Pupil Behavior

The Buffalo school system maintains good discipline and, in most of the schools, good pupil morale. The pupils seem to get along well with their teachers and with one another. In many class and extraclass activities, pupils seem buoyant, enthusiastic, and dedicated. The staff shortages, inadequate curriculum adaptations, inexperienced teachers and unsuitable facilities now existing in many of the Buffalo schools present conditions that would ordinarily engender many discipline problems. In Buffalo, on the contrary, pupils seem to be generally well behaved. Even in poorly taught classes or classes taught by substitute teachers, the students seem orderly and courteous, despite an apparent lack of interest.

The pupils realize that in the Buffalo schools infractions of discipline are not tolerated. When a pupil habitually creates a serious disturbance, he is removed from class. If the administrative staff is unable to bring about an improvement in his behavior, steps are taken to discharge him from school. He and his parents are given a hearing before a staff member from the central office. A considerable period of time may elapse before the hearing is held; in the meantime the pupil may continue his schooling by reporting to a special center located in an elementary school building, where guidance and tutorial services are available.

Although the number of disobedient or recalcitrant pupils represents a small minority, the assistant principals in some schools at present devote a very large percentage of their time to the maintenance of good discipline.

While their efforts seem to produce results, the procedures in some instances need to be reviewed. For example, in one school, when a pupil must go to the lavatory, the teacher must give him a note which he presents to the main office, where it must be countersigned. He must sign a book in the office before going to the lavatory and must sign it again on his return. In a few schools, the girls' lavatories are kept locked. The extent to which these measures contribute to good-citizenship habits or good health habits is questionable. In some schools, teacher aides are being used to monitor the girls' lavatories. This arrangement should prove more beneficial. The paramount need, however, is to inculcate in the pupils a more deep-seated respect for the school through improved teaching and curriculum adaptation, as well as through lessons and assembly programs that focus on citizenship responsibilities.

Need for Staff

The Buffalo secondary schools are understaffed. Considering the numerous basic services provided by a secondary school, it is surprising that these schools are functioning as well as they do.

A recently completed analysis of secondary school pupil-teacher ratios in almost 200 school districts of the State shows an average ratio of 17.7 pupils per teacher. At one time, schools in large cities were able to operate with ratios ranging from 20 to 23 pupils per teacher, but this situation no longer obtains. Because of changes in pupil population and the need to provide small classes and special programs for pupils of widely varying backgrounds, the large cities now need smaller pupil-teacher ratios than other districts. One of the 200 districts that were studied was one of the "Big Six" cities, which was found to have a pupil-teacher ratio of 17 to 1.

In Buffalo the greatest staff deficiencies occur in the academic high schools, which are still laboring under a pupil-teacher ratio of 23 to 1. The second largest need is in the seventh and eighth grade programs in the elementary schools. The pupil-teacher ratio in these programs is 19.2 to 1.

In order to provide an effective program, the Buffalo secondary schools must have a pupil-teacher ratio of not more than 17 pupils per teacher. To achieve this ratio, the teaching staff in the secondary schools, exclusive of the vocational schools, should be increased by 29 percent. This means 324 additional staff members. It should be emphasized, however, that this figure also provides for strong supervision at the local school level, for it includes in each secondary school not only teachers, but also department heads with one half or one third teaching loads in each academic subject and in business education. The additional staff would also provide driver education teachers.

If the same criteria were applied to the non-shop subjects in the vocational schools, these schools would need 28 additional teachers. On the basis of State-recommended standards for guidance personnel, Buffalo would also need to add 20 counselors. This represents a 32.5 percent increase in the guidance staff.

Buffalo needs more assistant principals, more psychologists, more attendance teachers, and more school social workers. Some schools need full time persons in each of the latter two services. In addition to professional staff, there is need for more clerical and office help throughout the system generally, so that the teachers, counselors, and administrators may spend more time on their regular duties. Teacher aides are already being used in some of the schools to help with monitoring and clerical duties. Additional services of this type would relieve the pressure on the teaching staff and would greatly improve the operation of the schools.

Teacher Recruitment and Retention

Buffalo not only needs more staff; it also needs to resolve the more knotty problem of how to retain its teachers once they are recruited. A third, but equally cogent problem, is that of attracting teachers from a wider geographical area. The recommendations relative to increasing the staff in the various schools will be helpful only to the extent that Buffalo brings into its school system well-prepared, highly competent, experienced teachers, guidance counselors, and supervisors. The establishment of department heads and favorable pupil-staff ratios becomes a fruitless venture if the staff members who are put into the schools are not well qualified and of proven competence.

The Superintendent of Schools, in a recent report, emphasized the recruitment needs in the following words: "No one will deny that we need adequate, safe, clean, and functional buildings, and well-planned and varied curriculums, supplies, equipment, and a variety of special services, but none of these is as important as the need to staff every classroom with a well-prepared, thoroughly qualified and dedicated teacher. We must have understanding teachers. To continue to recruit such quality teachers is an ever-present challenge to school authorities and, in a lesser degree, to the community."

Buffalo is not meeting this challenge. Despite active recruitment efforts throughout the country, on-campus visits to all the major teacher education institutions, extensive newspaper advertisements and mail campaigns, the Buffalo schools have been unable to recruit experienced teachers. The school system has has become too ingrown, partly because of the limitations under which it operates. The teachers recruited from outside the area are few in number, and most of them do not remain beyond the second or third year. Buffalo's failure to give adequate salary recognition to previous teaching experience or to grant increments for military service does not help the recruitment effort.

The second largest city of the Empire State not only is unable to attract experienced teachers; it is losing many of the teachers whom it has trained. The suburban schools offer more modern and more attractive facilities and equipment, more liberal salary provisions, more supervisory help in improving teaching skills, smaller classes, and pupils who are tractable and responsive to conventional teaching methods. From 400 to 450 positions become vacant in Buffalo each year. While approximately 20 percent of these openings are due to death or retirement, the majority stem from job dissatisfaction and opportunities for better positions.

The staff turnover, especially in schools in depressed areas and in the academic high schools in fringe areas, is 20 to 30 percent each year. The heaviest exodus takes place during July and August, when experienced replacements have already accepted other positions and are not available. To fill the vacancies, the school officials have no choice other than to use "temporary teachers."

Unlike smaller districts, Buffalo is required by law to select teachers through competitive examinations, which are given twice a year for 32 different types of positions. For the 400 to 450 annual vacancies, there are 500 to approximately 1,000 applicants. The school officials are limited in their choice, for 30 to 35 percent of the applicants either fail the examination or do not appear for it. After the list is issued, many of the eligibles decline appointments.

Consequently, of the 389 new teachers who joined the school system in the school year 1965-66, only 38 percent were from the eligible list. Sixty-two percent, or more than 6 out of 10, were "temporary teachers," many of whom were college graduates serving in default of certification. Because of teacher shortages, many school systems throughout the State make use of "teachers in default." But these school systems are not faced with the specially difficult problems that confront the State's second largest city; nor do they use uncertified teachers to the extent they are used in Buffalo, where 26.3 percent of the staff consists of "temporary teachers."

The highest percentage of "temporary teachers" occurs in recently established schools and schools in depressed neighborhoods. In the central part of the city, there is one school that would face difficult challenges even with a fully experienced staff. Yet this school is compelled to carry on with a faculty of 41 "temporary teachers," 25 probationaries, and 18 tenure teachers; however, only one of the latter is in the academic subjects. Because of teacher shortages, the school authorities have assigned recent college graduates to this school and have provided a more favorable pupil-teacher ratio, but numbers alone are not adequate substitutes for experience and professional qualifications.

The Personnel Division of the central office is laboring under regulations that were mandated more than three decades ago when hordes of candidates were available for each vacancy. While the examination system should be retained, the procedures should be modernized to eliminate the time lag involved in producing eligible lists.

The fact that Buffalo is staffing more and more of its classrooms with raw recruits who are unproved or inadequately prepared is bound to have serious consequences. It is wishful thinking to expect these inexperienced instructors to draw out the inherent talents of pupils or raise their level of aspiration.

Staff Characteristics

In 15 years, Buffalo has changed from a school system with a predominantly older, stable faculty to one with an overwhelmingly young, inexperienced, and relatively unstable staff. One large high school is left with only two experienced teachers in the English department, both of them nearing retirement. In another high school, 37 per cent of the staff are probationary teachers. In a third school, more than one half of the teachers have had less than five years of experience.

The few remaining older teachers generally show outstanding skill and resourcefulness in the classroom. A considerable number of the younger teachers also exhibit competence of the highest quality. The largest group on the staff, however, consists of new, inexperienced teachers who need expert help.

The dedication of some individual staff members is almost heroic. In one high school where the enrollment included many disadvantaged pupils, the assistant principals seemed to be working vigorously and almost to the point of exhaustion to maintain the smooth operation of the program. At the opposite extreme, there were some leaders whose zeal appeared to have been dulled by the obstacles confronting them. The experienced guidance counselors seemed genuinely interested in their pupils and reflected a background of successful teaching experience.

The principals are educators who have served in the Buffalo system for many years and are thoroughly familiar with its operation. In most cases, they seem to have the respect of their staff. Some devote their major energies to managerial duties, while others provide quiet, unobtrusive leadership. A number of them plan new projects with their staff and press the central office for approval and materials. The assistant principals, on the whole, are hard-working lieutenants who supervise attendance and discipline and see that various routine details are properly carried out. In general, the principals and their assistants seem capable of providing greater educational leadership than staff limitations, traditions, and the central office organization permit. While promotion from within the staff must continue to be encouraged, Buffalo should also invite candidates from other communities to apply for principalship and assistant principalship positions, for the school system needs the new ideas and fresh approaches that competent educators with different backgrounds and experience can offer.

Administrative Organization and Procedures

The Buffalo schools are closely controlled. The writing of curriculum outlines, selection of textbooks, rating of teachers, planning of in-service meetings, preparation of the city-wide examinations, and responsibility for maintaining the quality of instruction are all carried out by city supervisors of English, social studies, mathematics, science, physical education, and foreign languages. In many of these projects, the supervisors work in cooperation with committees of teachers.

Theoretically, the secondary school principal has the responsibility for maintaining the quality of instruction in his school, but since the curriculum content, textbooks, teaching outcomes, and final examinations are prepared in the central office, he is left with very little residual authority over the instructional program. A few of the more dynamic principals, however, have been forthright in exerting their own leadership, and the central office has generally respected their wishes.

Although the schools suffer from too much uniformity, they are operating smoothly. The lines of authority and responsibility are sufficiently flexible to permit the school administrator to take prompt and appropriate action when problems arise. The working relationships between the local administrators and the central office are harmonious and reflect mutual understanding.

Most of the schools do not publish student handbooks because of lack of funds. Much of the necessary information, however, is contained in a central office brochure. A number of attractive reports and leaflets describing various aspects of the school program are provided by the central office. A large percentage of administrators feel that both the central office and the individual schools are in need of more adequate publications. While carefully planned publications and publicity releases are costly and require the services of expert personnel, they are necessary in order to gain public interest and support for the school program.

The public relations program needs to be improved and should involve a greater number of capable citizens and community leaders in various planning and resource capacities. It should be noted that the superintendent and school administrators maintain excellent relations with the personnel of the press, radio, and television. The school system has used the mass media to publicize its activities in an informative and constructive manner. What is also needed, however, is a more vivid portrayal of the handicaps under which the schools are laboring.

The present type of central office supervision and control was adopted as an economy measure in 1931, when the schools had very stable faculties and relatively few thorny problems. Although additional supervisors have recently been added to the staff, this type of administrative organization is still inadequate to deal with the two overriding challenges that exist at the local school level: that of educating disadvantaged children and that of learning how to do it. Each school needs more leaders and supervisors to work with pupils, parents, teachers, and the community on an everyday basis. The local schools should be given more authority and responsibility. As the 1951 survey report stated: "Because sociological backgrounds differ in the various areas of the city, it follows that the needs of children are not everywhere the same. The educational programs through which the school endeavors to meet these objectives should vary in accordance with the different needs in various sections of the city. The educational program should not be standardized. Within broad limits, individual schools should be free to develop programs adapted to the population group each serves."

This does not mean that the leadership pf the central office supervisors should be subrogated, but rather that it should be re-channeled. The main function of the central office should be to prod each local administrator and provide him with the staff, consultant services, and other resources he must have in order to meet the needs of the pupils in his school. Many of the present responsibilities of the central office specialists should be assumed by supervisory personnel in each school. The benefit that this interchange of roles can bring forth is already evident in the schools where the principals are exercising a greater amount of initiative.

The leadership role of the local principals should be further increased by encouraging them to (1) develop pilot programs, (2) serve as consultants in the recruitment of teachers, (3) participate in regional, state, and national conferences dealing with education, (4) join community clubs like the Rotary Club and other organizations that can help in gaining employment for the graduates and support for the school, (5) visit other schools both within the city as well as within and outside the State, and (6) serve as part-time consultants to advise and assist new principals.

Program in Grades 7, 8 and 9

The secondary schools of Buffalo provide a very wide range of courses. To strengthen the program in grades 7, 8, and 9, the school authorities in recent years established five junior high schools in which the teaching staff concentrates its efforts solely on the needs of the younger adolescents. In grades 7 and 8, the junior high schools, in keeping with State recommendations, give pupils departmentalized instruction in English, social studies, mathematics, science (including health), art, music, practical arts (homemaking for girls and industrial arts for boys), and physical education. In addition, pupils are given one period a week of swimming. Pupils may also take other subjects, according to their ability or needs; e.g. remedial work, typewriting, elementary algebra, a foreign language, or a music activity (band, orchestra, or chorus).

In grade 9, the pupils generally take one elective subject, in addition to the "required" courses in English, social studies, mathematics, science, and physical education. The "elective" may be a foreign language, typewriting or introduction to business, industrial arts, homemaking, art, music or one of the three previously mentioned music activities. The pupils are also given one period a week of swimming.

About 61 percent of the seventh and eighth grade pupils are not in the junior high schools, but in various K-8 elementary schools throughout the city. In spite of the Board's efforts to provide these pupils with services comparable to those in the junior high schools, the program falls far short of this objective because of limitations of enrollment, staff, facilities, and leadership.

One-third of the ninth grade pupils of Buffalo are in the junior high schools. The other two thirds are in the academic high schools and vocational schools. In the former they receive a program similar to that of the junior high schools, except that the facilities for art, music, industrial arts, and homemaking are generally not so adequate, nor are the library facilities and science equipment so modern. The vocational schools enroll almost as many ninth grade boys as the academic high schools. The ninth graders spend a number of weeks in each of several vocational subjects on a tryout basis. In addition, they take English, social studies, related mathematics and related science. They do not have opportunities for art and music. The vocational school girls receive homemaking only if they elect it as their trade course. The extracurricular activities in the vocational schools are much more limited than in the academic high schools.

Program in Grades 10, 11 and 12 of the Academic High Schools

The seven "academic high schools" are really general high schools offering both academic and non-academic courses. Because of inadequate facilities and staff, some of the non-academic sequences are not prospering, while others are thriving so well that they may be attracting pupils who, because of their potential ability, should perhaps be in more challenging courses.

The academic high schools offer elective sequences in science, mathematics, and eight foreign languages, as well as in business, art, music, industrial arts, and homemaking. The business curriculum includes three types of programs: secretarial, bookkeeping, and retailing. In art and industrial arts, the choice of courses seems more limited than in other subjects.

Foreign language programs are offered in Lating, French, Spanish, German, Italian, Polish, Russian, and Hebrew. The first three languages are taught in all of the high schools; the others are taught in one or two schools, often in communities where special interest in the language is related to the national origin of the residents. If pupils study the language of the country from which their forebears emigrated, they should pursue it in sufficient depth to be able to use it fluently.

A wide range of pupil activities at both the junior and senior high school levels provides pupils with opportunities to participate in worthwhile events, develops school spirit, and brings the school and community closer together. In a number of the schools the activities are winning strong community approval and support.

The academic high schools, with their older building facilities, offer a less varied range of activities. They include interest clubs, school newspapers, athletic teams, and student government groups. Because the local schools do not receive a budget allotment for student activities, these programs must be self-supporting. This imposes a "hidden tuition" which may embarrass some pupils.

Program in the Vocational Schools

The vocational schools of Buffalo, exclusive of Hutchinson Technical High School, offer 32 trade courses.* Hutchinson provides technical programs in 5 different fields. Twelve of the trade courses are four years in length, 19 are three years, and one (welding) is two years. The average enrollment ranges from 17 pupils in the three-year course for clerk-typist at Boys' Vocational to 665 pupils in the electrical trades course at Seneca Vocational. The second largest enrollment is in the four-year automotive mechanics course at Burgard.

In order to graduate from a vocational school, a pupil must complete English, social studies, physical education, and eight units in trade shop, as well as courses in related mathematics, science, and drawing. The Hutchinson Technical High School requires English, social studies, physical education, mechanical drafting, academic courses in science and mathematics, and eight units of technical shop. The pupils in Hutchinson achieve a larger percentage of Regents diplomas and college admissions than in any other public high school in the city.

As a pioneer in vocational education, Buffalo is very proud of its vocational schools. It has provided some of the strongest programs in the State. The shops are well equipped, and the pupils' work is very impressive. For example, the work being done with new printing equipment at Burgard reflects alert planning, as does the excellent computer program at Hutchinson Technical. Some commendable programs are in evidence in all of the vocational schools.

Except in Hutchinson Technical, the general education or academic part of the school program in the vocational schools is not adequate. While the school authorities deserve commendation for establishing high school courses in mathematics and science to replace some of the traditional courses in "related science" and "related mathematics," much work still needs to be done in securing experienced staff and developing standards equivalent to Statewide or Regents standards. The vocational schools do not have enough experienced, well-qualified teachers in the academic subjects, and the curriculum as handed down by the central office often does not reflect the needs of pupils in the individual schools. Furthermore, in the vocational schools, the shop program represents the pathway to success, and the pupils tend to regard the academic subjects as of subordinate importance. With inept or uninspired teaching, the situation becomes worse.

---

*See appendix for a complete analysis.

The vocational high schools of Buffalo are more selective than in most cities. They are not so-called "dumping grounds" for pupils of low ability. The pupils appear to have the capacity to do good academic work. If required to do so, many of them could probably achieve Regents standards in English, social studies, and other academic subjects. Regardless of whether or not these pupils enter a trade, it is a waste of human resources for them not to develop the skills that would prove to be their greatest strength in times of change and that would help them fulfill their citizenship responsibilities more intelligently. As the Superintendent's Committee to Study the Vocational Programs pointed out in its interim report: Many of the employment factors which characterized the period of the development of the vocational program in Buffalo do not exist today. The graduate of today faces an employment market which may require adaptability to several skills. Most workers will be employed in not just one type of job, but in several during their employment life. To succeed, they will have to have more general knowledge in communication skills, mathematics, science, and a cluster of related trade-industrial skills. In addition, they will have to expect to continue their education as apprentices, in on-the-job training situations, and in specialized re-training centers."

The Superintendent's Committee, in analyzing the vocational programs for the past five years, found that in 14 out of 30 programs one-third or less of the graduates were employed in the trade six months after graduation; in 13 programs, one-third to two-thirds were so employed, and in only three programs were two-thirds or more working in the trade six months after graduating.* The Committee concluded: "Many pupils who have spent three or four years in preparing for a specific trade are not employed in that trade."

The holding power of the vocational schools is 64.9 percent as against 70.6 percent for the academic high schools, a reversal of the situation that existed when vocational schools were first established. Out of 100 pupils entering Buffalo's vocational schools, less than one third will graduate and work in the trade or take post high school education six months later.

The high cost of vocational education programs, the high dropout rate, and the fact that large percentages of graduates do not pursue the trade for which they prepared raise questions as to how well these programs meet the needs of pupils. The Superintendent believes:

---

*See appendix for the complete analysis.

> "Since students in Buffalo enter vocational school at the age of thirteen or fourteen, that is, after graduation from elementary school at the eighth grade level, there hasn't been much of an attempt or much opportunity to assess the desires or the aptitudes of these young people."

Are the vocational courses too long? The Superintendent says: "Often I think vocational courses were expanded beyond necessity to make them four-year programs. We learned from the MDTA (Manpower Development Training Act) that you could intensively teach a skill and occupation to a mature person in a very short period of time, in weeks and months, rather than years. Our experience with these programs, plus the feeling I have had for a number of years, gained from my early teaching in a vocational school and my own experience in guidance, have encouraged me to accept the idea that we could do the same thing with young people. We could offer, for example, in a rather comprehensive curriculum, a good general or liberal arts background coupled with a short term vocational program leading to a definite skill."

To strengthen the vocational program, the following changes are recommended:

(1) The establishment of one or two comprehensive high schools offering general education courses, as well as courses in several vocational trades should be encouraged on a pilot basis. The comprehensive high school provides greater opportunities to modify the pupil's program in accordance with his needs as he matures.

(2) Except for unusual individual cases, the ninth grade program in the vocational schools should be discontinued. Pupils at that age level should continue to receive, in the regular secondary schools, a broad program of exploratory experiences that are more appropriate to their needs, as a basis for making sounder educational decisions.

(3) The vocational courses should be critically examined to see whether they can be shortened.

(4) As the Superintendent has indicated, courses varying in length from six months to three years should be offered, and pupils attending academic high schools should have the opportunity to take them on a part-time basis.

(5) On a pilot basis, one or two vocational schools should be converted into vocational skills centers where pupils from other schools can come for part of the day to take occupational courses that meet their needs. These centers could also serve out-of-school youths either in the late afternoon or at other feasible hours.

(6) A follow-up study of vocational school graduates should be made two years, four years, and six years after graduation to learn how many are still employed in their trades.

(7) Pupils in vocational schools should be encouraged to achieve Regents standards in the required subjects.

(8) Vocational courses should be provided in the summer school for pupils from academic high schools, as well as from vocational high schools.

(9) General work-experience programs, as well as work-experience in distributive and trade education, should be extended in each high school, so that pupils can work part time and study part time for high school credit, under the supervision of a qualified work-experience coordinator in each building.

(10) A study should be made of the vocational skills now being taught, to determine which are needed by the graduates and which should be relegated to on-the-job training or post high school education.

Evening High Schools

Buffalo has provided a public evening high school since 1891. The current enrollment of 1200 pupils and a waiting list of 113 applicants indicate how popular this school is. Located in Bennett High School, the evening high school offers courses similar to those given in the day high schools, except that they are accelerated wherever possible. The school is in session three nights a week, and a pupil may enroll for as many as three subjects. Two-thirds of the pupils are over 21 years of age. The faculty is competent and experienced and provides excellent instruction. More than half of the graduates apply for admission to colleges and other post high school institutions.

With Federal funds, Buffalo opened a second evening program at East High School in April 1966, as well as a summer evening high school in the summer of 1966. The program at East is limited to persons under 21 years of age and has a current enrollment of 613 pupils. The school is in session five nights a week and a pupil may take five subjects. A large percentage of the pupils are unemployed. In the case of the younger pupils, this raises the question as to whether they should not be encouraged to return to day school, where they can receive more extended educational services.

The program at East High School, with its younger student body, presents a marked contrast to the serious, studious atmosphere at Bennett. While some students are mature in their approach to education, many of them seem to be attending school without any serious interest.

Both evening high schools have a high absentee rate, sometimes exceeding 50 percent of the student body. This should not be tolerated. The school authorities should adopt a rule allowing a reasonable number of absences (such as 6 or 7) and should drop pupils who go beyond this number.

Buffalo should be commended for providing, in the two evening high schools and 13 other centers throughout the city, non-credit, pre-high school courses for pupils who have completed their elementary education and wish to review English, arithmetic, and social studies.

The continued expansion of the evening high schools will make it necessary to provide these schools with more supervision and direction. The subject specialists should extend their services to the evening schools. Each school should also have a library open throughout each session, under the supervision of a certified librarian. The evening schools should develop more courses to meet pupil needs, such as the child-care course for young mothers and an employment-preparation course. With the cooperation of the New York State Employment Service, disadvantaged pupils should be guided into supervised work experience. Some of their evening instruction should relate to their day jobs.

Summer Schools

Buffalo has, for many years, operated summer high schools for pupils who fail during the regular semester. In 1966, Buffalo offered summer courses in five high schools to a total of 4206 pupils. The courses included English, social studies, science, mathematics, business education, and foreign languages.

Buffalo does not provide enrichment summer courses for pupils who wish to broaden their background, nor does it include courses for superior students, such as experimental biology, creative writing, advanced fiction, or advanced chemistry. No summer opportunities are extended to pupils who wish to study art, music, or dramatics; or who wish to try vocational courses.

Even more serious is the failure to provide courses for seventh and eighth grade pupils, who can profit greatly by studying under expert, experienced teachers during the summer. Driver education which, during the regular school year, is offered only in Burgard Vocational High School, should be considered for inclusion in the summer program. Many school systems have found this course easier to schedule and less costly in the summer session.

Special Programs

With State and Federal funds, Buffalo has established special programs designed to reduce the number of dropouts and assist disadvantaged pupils. Three projects (STEP, ABLE and RE-ENTRY), have been discontinued for lack of funds. STEP provided special school and work experience for 100 dropouts; ABLE attempted to identify and encourage potentially able pupils residing in disadvantaged neighborhoods, while PROJECT RE-ENTRY enabled guidance counselors to visit the homes of 476 dropouts, as a result of which 341 returned to school. The records in one school showed that 22.5 percent of the interviewed dropouts had I.Q.'s above 110, 55 percent were between 90 and 100 and only 22.5 percent were under 90. Some counselors commented: "Unless we do something in the curriculum area of our high schools, our holding power will never improve."

Federal ESEA funds have made possible a number of projects, including an evening high school, a summer remedial program, a program of professional concerts and dramatic performances in the schools, after-school cultural enrichment experiences for "disadvantaged" college-bound high school pupils, and a special language arts project.

The extent to which these Federally aided programs will be effective depends upon the staff who plan, implement, and supervise them, and upon the relationship with the regular program. The recruitment of qualified, experienced teachers is even more difficult for special projects than for the regular program. Because of the haste with which ESEA projects had to be organized, the teachers are not under the same supervision as the regular teachers, but have been placed under an ESEA coordinator in the central office, who determines the curriculum and selects teaching materials, thereby creating a serious dichotomy.

Five million dollars of Federal ESEA funds have been spent in Buffalo for supplementary programs. What this city needs even more urgently is the money with which to strengthen the regular program.

City-Wide Final Examinations

Final examinations in the Buffalo schools are city-wide tests prepared by central office specialists with the help of teacher committees. While all pupils must take these tests, they are not required to pass them, for the examination is averaged with the four marks received throughout the year. On the other hand, a pupil scoring 65 percent or better in the city-wide test passes the course even if he failed throughout the year. In many classes, therefore, preparation for the city-wide examinations seems to be the major goal of the course. A 1951 survey recommended that "since these tests limit the definition of what is important to be taught, they should be abolished and individual schools should be given adequate help and service in both achievement and aptitude testing."

Since 1951, the city-wide examinations have actually increased. The central office now prepares more than 70 tests, including regular tests for average and "honors" classes and "basic tests" for low-ability classes. The tremendous time and expense used in preparing these examinations could better be used to help local schools prepare curriculum adaptations and gain skill in testing and evaluation, for the poor testing techniques seen in some classes create more problems than they solve. For example, the four-page test on "The Ancient Mariner," which a second-year teacher administered, besides being poorly printed and poorly worded, required the pupils to remember many minor, inconsequential details that had nothing to do with poetry appreciation.

The school system which 15 years ago required all pupils to pass Regents now does not even insist that the most able pupils take these tests, let alone pass them. By preparing city-wide examinations in Regents subjects, Buffalo has provided an easier alternative to the State tests. This procedure, however, raises a question as to what extent the schools are challenging pupils to meet New York State standards of achievement.

In Regents subjects, exclusive of special courses for slow or below-average pupils, the city-wide examinations should be discontinued, and the pupils should be required to take the Regents examinations. Second-track courses or non-Regents courses in Regents subjects should be given a nomenclature that clearly distinguishes them from Regents courses.

Uniform examinations are not appropriate testing devices for non-Regents courses, since these courses need to vary with local needs. In a city as large as Buffalo, however, some city-wide examinations are inevitable as long as department leadership does not exist in the local schools. Consequently, the abolishment of the city-wide tests in non-Regents courses should take place on a gradual basis, as the local schools acquire more supervisory staff and gain more skill in test construction. During the interim, schools wishing to develop their own tests for these courses should be encouraged to do so with the help and approval of the central office.

Pupil Promotion and Holding Power

The policy in effect since 1958 states: "No pupil should be retarded more than one year during the first six grades of school." Promotion from the sixth grade into the seventh grade is determined by the principal and teacher on the basis of what they consider to be best for the individual child.

In grades 7-12, a pupil receives a passing mark in a subject if he scores at least 65 percent in the final examination or if his marks for the year, when combined with the final examination, result in an average of at least 65 percent. To advance from grade 7 into grade 8, and from grade 8 into grade 9, a pupil is expected to pass three of the four academic subjects (language arts, science, mathematics, and social studies) and three of the four special subjects (music, art, physical education, industrial arts, or homemaking). Pupils not meeting these requirements, however, "may be promoted on the basis of social maturity, sense of responsibility, satisfactory study habits, chronological age, health, and emotional stability." While this flexibility is essential, it is equally important that the schools maintain adequate standards of pupil effort and achievement. It would be well, therefore, periodically to evaluate the implementation of these promotion policies.

One commendable outcome of the present promotion policy has been the reduction of overageness in grades 7, 8, and 9 from 13.3 percent in 1950 to 5.3 percent in 1965 and a reduction of school dropouts in grades 6, 7, and 8 from 724 to 73.

In spite of the improvement in holding power since 1950, the number of pupils in Buffalo who drop out of school each year ranges from 1700 to over 2000. About 25 percent of these pupils are under 17 years of age. They leave school by securing working certificates, although large numbers of them join the ranks of the unemployed. This army of new school dropouts, when added to the groups of previous years, constitutes a formidable problem, for these young men and women often lack the skills for holding a job and for living successfully. The school system alone cannot correct this yearly exodus. It must have the active help and support of many community agencies. Given this help, however, it can and should make far-reaching curriculum adaptations, including more supervised work-experience and more individual guidance.

School Housing and Facilities

The educational facilities in the secondary schools vary greatly from school to school. All of the academic high schools and most of the vocational schools are housed in relatively old buildings. The same is true of the K-8 elementary schools. Although additions have been constructed for three of the high schools and extensive alterations have been carried out in many of the others, the facilities in these buildings are designed for an outmoded type of program and teaching methodology. Homemaking rooms in general are uni-purpose rooms and lack space; some of the art rooms are inadequate; many of the libraries are small, and industrial arts shops and other special rooms are, in some cases, located in the basement.

Some of the schools lack adequate faculty rooms, conference rooms, or even adequate toilet facilities for the staff. Storage space is too limited. The lighting in some schools is inadequate. Some rooms need plumbing and electrical repairs, new shades, and re-painting. In one school, a teacher removed the torn, dirty window shades and replaced them with venetian blinds purchased with his own funds.

On the other hand, four of the five junior high schools are new modern structures with well-planned libraries, well-equipped science rooms, adequate music rooms, and attractive shops, art rooms, and homemaking suites. In addition to excellent gymnasiums, there is a swimming pool in each school. These schools also have up-to-date audio visual equipment.

Although the Superintendent has tried to secure budgetary funds for replacements, the instructional material in the older buildings is obsolete. Movies and filmstrips are so old that the views they portray seem ludicrous. Pamphlet material is outdated. Federal money has enabled some schools to obtain long-needed equipment, such as overhead projectors, tape recorders, phonographs, and many dictionaries and library books. In some cases, however, these materials are not being used because there is no convenient storage space near the classrooms and because there is no one to arrange for their distribution and maintenance. In one high school, audio-visual materials are crowded into a basement storage room that is kept secure with two locks.

Since many of their present pupils are limited in experiential backgrounds, the Buffalo secondary schools should develop stronger audio-visual programs as a means of providing them with vital vicarious experiences. In order that all teachers may know what instructional materials are available, each school should establish a resources center, preferably to be housed in the library. Obsolete or inappropriate books, slides, and other equipment should be replaced with more suitable materials, including appropriate teaching machines. Operable electrical outlets should be provided in each classroom so that teachers may use audio-visual equipment.

The Superintendent, in a recent report, pointed out: "We have been able to give each child a full day of instruction, despite overcrowding in certain areas." The overcrowding is most serious in the academic high schools, many of which have enrollments 20 to 25 percent beyond their normal capacity. Because of the shortage of rooms, these schools are using the auditorium and the cafeteria for study halls. In addition, they have been compelled to schedule many classes that are too large.

The serious understaffing in the academic high schools cannot be corrected until additional rooms are provided. The Buffalo authorities have plans for a new high school and for at least one new building to house grades 5, 6, 7, and 8. It is urged that both of these new facilities be constructed as soon as possible. The high schools need help badly and should not have to wait. Furthermore, as the school authorities begin to implement their recently adopted "middle school" plan, even more high school rooms will be needed to accommodate the ninth grade classes now housed in the junior high schools.

The Board's building plans should be expedited, in order to eliminate the seventh and eighth grade classes now dispersed in 35 elementary schools. These classes should be combined, as soon as possible, into middle schools or other types of units that can provide adequate facilities and enrollments for a school program comparable to that offered in the five secondary schools which currently serve seventh and eighth grade pupils.

While the "middle school" organization will provide, at an earlier grade level, more classes with pupils of diversified backgrounds, plans should also be made to eliminate the Clinton Junior High School and the East High School. In spite of the additional staff and resources given to them by the Board of Education, these schools, because of their almost entirely non-white enrollment, are unable to provide pupils with sufficient opportunities to intermingle with, understand, and be understood by schoolmates of other ethnic backgrounds. The East High School situation is more urgently in need of correction, for the high school years represent the pupils' last opportunity to attend school with children of other backgrounds.

Improvement of Instruction

While Buffalo needs additional secondary school staff and more experienced staff, the most imperative need of all is supervisory personnel at the local school level to help teachers improve their professional efforts and work together as a coordinated team.

The secondary school principal has neither the time nor the staff to assist teachers with curriculum adaptations, teaching skills, or department planning, nor does the central office expect him to do these things. The assistant principals do not provide instructional leadership. As has already been mentioned, their duties deal mostly with discipline, attendance, distribution of supplies and textbooks, and building supervision. The schools have no department heads and in many cases do not even hold department meetings to discuss instructional problems and coordinate procedures. Instructional supervision, therefore, is carried out chiefly by the central office supervisors in each subject.

The central office specialists have made energetic efforts to keep pace with the needs of the school system by organizing conferences for probationary teachers; televising in-service courses; conducting summer workshops with ESEA funds, and organizing committees to prepare curriculum materials during the summer. In an effort to meet the needs of pupils of different levels of ability, they have developed a three-track program for the honors, average, and basic or slow pupils, respectively. In a recent evaluation of these courses, the school authorities concluded: "Much work still needs to be done before this program can be considered to have reached full effectiveness. Teachers need more help with special methods and materials suited to the needs of the various levels."

There is an increasing need to provide assistance for the teaching staff as more and more new and inexperienced teachers come into the system. The Superintendent called attention to this problem as far back as 1960: "The increasing number of new teachers entering our school system, replacing in many cases teachers of long experience, places a continuously greater responsibility upon the supervisory and administrative staff." To assist new teachers, the Buffalo authorities appointed a full-time "helping teacher" in each school, but since he is not a specialist in each curriculum area, he is generally unable to help the teacher with subject content or with teaching methods and materials relating to the subject.

In spite of the valiant work of the central office specialists and the diligence of the "helping teachers," the program of instructional improvement at the local school level is entirely inadequate. Much more must be done to mold the youthful, relatively inexperienced staff into a strong, well-coordinated teaching corps. The leadership must be provided in the individual school.

The principal should be given the primary responsibility for curriculum adaptation and instructional leadership in his building. The assistant principal should share in these activities as well as in administration. Many of the routine duties now performed by assistant principals should be assigned to other staff members, even if this requires the establishment of an intermediate administrative title between that of teacher and assistant principal.

To carry out his role of instructional leader, the principal needs expert department chairmen to work under his guidance in coordinating the work of each department, adapting curriculum, planning learning activities, selecting materials, and giving teachers continued on-the-spot assistance in class management, lesson goals, and teaching skills. With this type of assistance, some of the procedures mandated by the central office may be replaced by procedures developed within each school.

The department chairmen should have part-time teaching assignments so that they may continue to understand from first-hand experience the teaching conditions confronting their colleagues. In general, chairmen should be provided for the departments with the larger number of teachers. In smaller departments, the system of central office consultant may prove sufficient. It may also be possible to assign a chairman to serve two or more schools on a shared-service basis.

The department chairman arrangement will not fulfill its purpose unless outstanding leaders are appointed to this key position. The chairmen should constitute a professional group second in prestige only to the principals and assistant principals. Indeed, they should provide a fertile field of future administrative leaders for the Buffalo school system. The salary and prestige of the position should be made high enough to attract strong, outstanding specialists not only from the Buffalo area, but from all over the nation, and vacancies should be filled on a permanent basis only when suitable candidates have been found. In the meantime, acting chairmen should carry out the duties on a temporary basis.

Summary of Recommendations

1. The Buffalo secondary schools should make more strenuous efforts to raise the level of aspiration of each pupil and should encourage more pupils to prepare for post-high school education. To achieve this goal, stronger guidance services, curriculum adaptation, remedial instruction, and home-school communication should be provided.

2. With the help of teachers, administrators, and laymen, the Board of Education should prepare a statement of objectives for the secondary schools.

3. The secondary school principal should be given greater leadership responsibilities and the functions of the central office staff should be modified with this goal in mind.

4. The role of the assistant principal should be changed so that he can devote a major portion of his time to assisting the principal in instructional improvement activities.

5. To meet the urgent need for improving instruction and to help the principal in his instructional leadership responsibilities, each secondary school should be provided with expert department chairmen recruited nationally.

6. To provide the necessary number of teachers, including department chairmen, the teaching staff should be increased by at least 29 percent, with particular emphasis on the recruitment of well-qualified, experienced teachers of proven competence. Salaries and teaching conditions should be improved so as to attract and retain strong teachers and supervisors not only from the Buffalo vicinity, but also from other areas.

7. Enough well qualified teachers should be hired so that it will not be necessary to use temporary teachers, except for substitute assignments.

8. New school buildings should be constructed as soon as possible to relieve the overcrowded high schools. The seventh and eighth grade programs currently offered in the elementary schools should be brought together into school units that include 400 to 500 pupils in grades 7 and 8 and that also include lower or higher grade levels, as the school authorities may determine on the basis of pupil needs.

9. Pupil skills in reading and arithmetic should be improved through massive schoolwide efforts that include not only direct instruction in reading, but also wide use of audio-visual materials, teaching machines, and a great variety of activities for broadening pupil experience and vocabulary.

10. Pupils of average and above average ability in English and social studies and pupils enrolled in elective Regents subjects should be required to take the Regents examinations, and the more capable pupils should be encouraged to qualify for the State Regents Diploma.

    City-wide tests should be offered in non-Regents courses only, but should be discontinued as soon as the individual schools are able to develop their own valid and reliable tests.

11. The general academic part of the program in the vocational schools should be upgraded and improved. On a pilot basis, one or two vocational schools should be converted into vocational skills centers which pupils may attend for part of the day and which offer courses of varying lengths.

12. Admission to vocational schools should, in general, be limited to pupils who have completed the ninth grade.

13. The development of a comprehensive high school which offers vocational, general, and college-preparatory courses should be encouraged.

14. The ESEA programs in each school should be organized, staffed, and supervised under the leadership of the building principal and should be adapted to the needsof the pupils, with the advice and assistance of the central office.

15. The expanding evening school program should be given greater direction and supervision, and appropriate standards of attendance and achievement should be developed and maintained. Unemployed evening school pupils of high school age should be encouraged to return to day school. The others should be given work-experience, pre-employment help, and help in job placement.

16. The summer school programs should be expanded to include courses for seventh and eighth grade pupils, academic courses for non-repeaters, courses in art, music, dramatics, practical arts, and driver education, and courses in vocational subjects.

17. More staff should be provided in the public relations program to make clear what the schools are trying to do and the resources they need to do the job effectively.

18. Plans should be made to eliminate the Clinton Junior High School and the East High School, as well as to achieve a more diversified student body in secondary schools which now have enrollments that are almost entirely from one ethnic group.

19. A more comprehensive series of in-service courses carrying college credit should be planned for the Buffalo staff in cooperation with area colleges.

Postscript

The Superintendent has on repeated occasions dramatized the needs of the Buffalo schools. The recommendations contained in this report are, in most cases, parallel to recommendations that he has made over the past five years. The problem that confronts the school system is typified in the following deletions from the Superintendent's budget request for 1967-68:

219 additional positions requested	17 granted
summer school classes for non-failures (grades 9-12)	Deleted
summer school remedial classes for seventh and eighth grade pupils	Deleted
art, music, and physical education instruction for primary grade pupils	Deleted
23 elementary school librarians	Deleted
24 remedial reading teachers for schools now lacking this service	Deleted
teachers of foreign languages for the elementary schools	Deleted
7.5 teachers for full-time string instruction	Deleted
"crisis teachers" for Learning Adjustment Classes	Deleted
6 additional attendance teachers	Deleted
4 school psychologists	Deleted
4 visiting teachers	Deleted
9 counselors to provide certified counselors in all K-8 schools lacking this service	Deleted
additional clerical help	Deleted
23.5 teaching positions for mentally and physically handicapped	Deleted
driver education program (budgeted at $297,000)	Deleted
12 positions to strengthen the junior high school program	Deleted
42 positions to provide added staff for schools receiving pupils from the inner city	Deleted
budget for supplies	Reduced by $200,000
budget for purchase of equipment	Cut by 50 percent
budget for library books	Reduced by 75 percent*

---

*Now less than 75¢ per pupil as against national average of $4.00 a pupil.

Appendix

Per Cent of Vocational High School Graduates Taking Post High School Education or Employed in Trade 6 Months After Graduation*

(Based on a 5-Year Average)

Course	School	Length of Course	1 Average Total Enrollment	2 % Who Complete Courses	3 No. Graduates Yearly	4 % Graduates Working in Trade 6 Mos. Later	5 % Graduates Taking Post HS Courses	Total of Column 4 and Column 5
Advertising Art	Fosdick	3 yrs.	50	85	14	29.4	7	36.4
Aircraft Mechanics	Burgard	4 "	271	65	44	12.2	50	62.2
Auto Mechanics	Burgard	4 "	592	57	85	71.6	7	78.6
Baking	Emerson	4 "	42	57	6	43.3	10	53.3
Beauty Culture	Fosdick	3 "	133	64	28	43.9	1	44.9
Boat Building	Burgard	4 "	39	60	6	24.1	21	45.1
Bricklaying	McKinley	3 "	36	85	10	28.8	8	36.8
Business	Boys	3 "	17	54	3	14.2	7	21.2
" (Bk. & Sales)	Fosdick	3 "	163	61	33			
" (Secretarial)	Fosdick	3 "	78	78	20			
Carpentry	McKinley	3 "	103	76	26	32.6	16	48.6
Clothing Trades	Fosdick	3 "	109	58	21	48.5	7	55.5
Drafting (Mech.)	Boys	3 "	18	85	5	7.7	8	15.7
Drafting	Emerson	3 "	51	65	11	9.4	38	47.4
Electrical	Boys	3 "	40	83	11	20.0	2	22.0
Electrical	Seneca	3 "	665	72	158	19.0	30	49.0
Foods (Prep)	Emerson	4 "	69	58	10	36.5	27	63.5
Foods (Trades)	Fosdick	3 "	59	56	11	32.7	7	39.7
Horticulture	McKinley	4 "	50	64	8	47.4	16	63.4
Machine Shop	Boys	3 "	50	67	11	40.7	0	40.7
Machine Shop	Emerson	4 "	166	58	24	41.1	8	49.1
Machine Shop	McKinley	4 "	161	79	32	40.9	11	51.9
Machine Shop	Seneca	3 "	177	70	41	47.2	19	66.2
Painting, Wood Fin.	Emerson	4 "	35	45	4	33.3	10	43.3
Plumbing	McKinley	3 "	55	82	15	51.4	8	59.4
Prac. Nursing	Fosdick	3 "	66	92	20	90.0	3	93.0
Printing	Burgard	4 "	116	76	22	65.5	14	79.5
Sheet Metal	Boys	3 "	19	32	2	18.2	0	18.2
Sheet Metal	McKinley	3 "	29	83	8	46.3	7	53.3
Upholstering	Emerson	4 "	28	43	3	42.8	0	42.8
Welding	Emerson	2 "	36	61	11	25.0	2	27.0
Woodworking	Emerson	4 "	150	69	26	25.2	2	27.2

*From report Occupational Education in Buffalo Public Schools, Board of Education, Buffalo. March 8, 1967

Note: The percentages for graduates employed full time in the trade do not include those employed in related trades as the classification of related trades was an indefinite classification.

Post high school education for vocational pupils takes many forms. In aircraft mechanics pupils attend a fifth-year program at Burgard. Many graduates of the Foods program go to Paul Smith's College. An occasional Foods graduate goes to Cornell. Graduates of the Electrical program at Seneca go to four year colleges or to Erie County Technical School. Graduates of other programs also go to Erie County Technical School.

Data for Hutchinson Technical High School have not been included in this report, since it is not a typical vocational school.

√

PART II

FACILITIES

The target date for completing the recommendations made in the facilities section of the Buffalo Survey is the same as the expectancy date for the remainder of the report, which has been set as the end of the school year 1974-75. This corresponds with the projection of enrollment data made by the Department's Bureau of Statistical Services.

In arriving at a suggested housing solution for the Buffalo school district certain criteria were used. It was felt that while a period of life expectancy for a building may be far in excess of 50 years, educational programs warrant considerable renovation within a structure at least once every 50 years. While it is true that adequate housing is needed to establish certain programs and organizational patterns, efforts to maintain economy should not be permitted to lower the quality of such programs below certain points. In other words not only were such items as long-wearing floor covering considered for both replacement and new construction purposes, but the kind of floor covering which would keep maintenance to a minimum was ranked above economy.

Building capacities were determined using the established and recommended procedures set forth by the Division of Educational Facilities Planning of the New York State Education Department as opposed to capacities developed by any other organization or agency.

The facilities portion of the report maintained a goal of providing maximum education for each dollar spent on housing. Consequently, in arriving at cost estimates very careful attention was devoted to making sure that a maximum amount of space within the total structure was assigned to classroom areas and a minimum amount of space assigned to areas which did not influence quality education. This procedure does not limit the construction of facilities having aesthetic value.

Similarly the estimates for renovation or for updating existing plants were based on certain assumptions. Where old structures were found to be sound and where the Department program specialists felt that certain rooms and structures could be used for current and future programs, the projection assumed that a classroom environment commensurate with latest information in the field would be appropriate. Thus new lighting was included to provide the best visual environment, new acoustic treatment was included to provide that kind of environment and, to a certain degree, some of the projection covered the thermo environment. However, air conditioning was not included although this item would yield a better thermo environment. If the State continues to expand its extended school year program, air conditioning may become an expense at a later date.

Replacement of expensive hand operated equipment has been included as part of the modernization projection. For example, existing handfed coal-burning boilers have been scheduled to be converted either to gas or oil fuel and to be equipped with automatic controls.

The projection also considers the abandonment of small, inefficient and uneconomical units, as well as buildings which are either wholly or in part framed with wood. In some cases, however, because of immediate need and the relatively short period between the completion of the report and the target date, a number of inefficient units are being retained for use.

Finally, it should be noted that most of the expenditures anticipated within this projection, especially those which are concerned with modernization, could qualify for building aid under the existing aid law at the Buffalo aid ratio rate.

Remodeling and Renovation

Buffalo has approximately 100 buildings covering all educational levels. Fewer than ten percent of these were built since 1950. Conversely about 20 percent of the buildings which are still in use were built in whole or in part prior to the start of this century. With a long history of limited maintenance, it is not surprising to find a great many details affecting operation which need correction either immediately or in the near future.

Many of the existing buildings in the city of Buffalo can be made into good educational plants. In order to accommodate current programs, however, and to provide a modern, attractive, safe environment, many of these buildings will need additional work. Some of the more expensive items which require correction in order to meet current acceptable standards are the elimination of deadend corridors, the installation of non-locking hardware for classrooms and places of assembly, the elimination of combustible cane fiber tile, the provision of adequate artificial illumination and the provision of ceiling and wall surfaces which allow for a good visual environment. In addition, cycles of maintenance and repair must be developed and adhered to on a continuing basis. The lack of such cycles has resulted in a current situation in which more than the average amount of patching and painting is required. Broken windows have not been replaced quickly enough, which has permitted the weather to further deteriorate facilities. If window breakage in certain areas of the city continues, thought should be given to replacing glass with a non-breakable substance. Coal burning furnaces should be eliminated. Automatic controls should be installed where possible. All buildings to be renovated should be inspected for minor roof, gutter and drain leaks and the necessary repairs should be made. In some cases, the exterior of buildings should be sealed to prevent water and weather seepage. Some existing fences need repair and maintenance and repaid is required on some school yard areas. In summary, over 75 of the city's buildings are in need of some remodeling, renovation, or updating. The specifics for each school are on file, but the total projected cost is in excess of $19 million.

Vocational and Technical Education

In addition, the Buffalo Board of Education has made proposals which concern the expansion of the city's vocational and technical education programs. Departmental specialists in these areas have examined the proposals and found them not only reasonable, but in fact, desirable. Succinctly, the plan calls for a better integration of students from all backgrounds into a job oriented program so successful students may find gainful employment on a relatively high level as opposed to the lowest ranking jobs which are currently available to high school dropouts. Expansion of the programs as used here include broadening the scope of present curriculum offerings, acquiring new modern equipment, and expanding the current space alloted for the programs. In this manner, the number of participants could be greatly increased and the complete modernization and refurnishing of the existing space could be accomplished. Thus, this office supports the proposal made by the Board of Education for the expenditure of 13 million dollars for this purpose. Details of these proposals are on file in the Board of Education Offices.

Abandonment and Migration

A number of existing buildings should be scheduled for abandonment some time within the next decade. Although the exact date for each abandonment is of little importance, it should be accomplished before the target date. By establishing a schedule, the district will be better able to solve the problem. Finally, new facilities needed to house the projected increase in students stemming from migration within the city could be in the form of new units or additions to existing structures. The determination should be made on the basis of a detailed study of the specific area immediately prior to the time of new construction. It is estimated that the total cost to house an additional 14,000 pupils in new structures in grades 5-8 as planned by the Board of Education would be $42,000,000 and to house the additional 5,000 students in grades 9-12 would cost an estimated $15,000,000. No additional new space is needed to accommodate students at the K-4 level. This estimate is based on the fact that all 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th grade students presently housed in K-8 schools will be housed in new facilities. It is estimated that approximately 16,000 pupil spaces would be made available the existing buildings.

PART III

COMPARISON OF 1967-68 APPROPRIATIONS WITH PROJECTED 1974-75 BUDGET ESTIMATES

The purpose of making expenditure projections is to estimate the costs necessary to implement the recommendations made for staffing the elementary and secondary schools and for meeting building needs. The staffing recommendations were made by the Bureaus of Elementary Supervision and of Secondary Supervision; the building recommendations by the Division of Educational Facilities Planning. The recommendations are summarized in Tables 1 and 2.

Expenditure projections obviously must be predicated on certain assumptions. In this case, three major suppositions were made: (1) the recommendations will be fully implemented by 1974-75; (2) the present K-6, 7-9, 10-12 organization plan will, by 1974-75, be changed to a K-4-4-4 plan; and (3) existing laws will not be changed. It is,therefore, essential to note that if any one of these assumptions is changed, the expenditure projections must also be adjusted.

The comparison of the years of 1967-68 and 1974-75 is twofold. In one instance, 1967-68 appropriations have been compared with a 1974-75 budget that has been estimated at current cost levels. In the other instance, 1967-68 appropriations have been compared with a 1974-75 budget, which assumes that the same degree of inflation will occur during the next seven-year period, as has occurred during the past seven-year period.

With the exception of George-Barden and Smith-Hughes monies, no Federally aided programs have been included in this comparative study. The Federal programs are accounted for outside the General Fund, and are described in the revenue analysis section of this study.

To show balanced estimated budgets for 1974-75, a summary of State aid projections developed in the revenue analysis section by the Division of Educational Finance has been provided. By including these estimates, various kinds of cost analyses can be made.

The expenditure estimates contained in this section of the report are only intended to be a guide. They may also provide a basis for future study and planning by both the Buffalo Board of Education and the State Education Department.

Table 1

Buffalo Study

Professional Staffing

Position	1967-68[1]	1974-75
Superintendent of Schools	1	1
Associate Superintendents	5	5*
Assistant Superintendents	7	7*
Directors	23	25*
Supervisors	31	31*
Elementary Principals	63	45
Elementary Assistant Principals	18	16
Academic High School Principals	7	10**
Vocational High School Principals	6	6***
Junior High School Principals	5	0
Middle School Principals	0	25**
Academic High School Assistant Principals	18	22
Vocational High School Assistant Principals	7	7
Junior High School Assistant Principals	44	0
Middle High School Assistant Principals	0	18
Kindergarten Teachers	129	129
Teachers 1-6[2]	1601	0
Teachers 7-12[3]	1585	0
Teachers 1-4[2]	0	1101
Teachers 5-8[3]	0	1177
Teachers 9-12	0	1257
Visiting and Attendance Teachers[4]	34	53
Psychologists	12	17
Guidance Counselors	62	110
Elementary Librarians	1.4	0
Secondary Librarians	22.6	0
Librarians 1-4	0	45
Librarians 5-8	0	25
Librarians 9-12	0	39
	3682	4171

*These figures may be modified as a result of a study of the central office.
**Assumes that 3 more high schools and 25 middle schools will be in operation.
***One or more of these schools may become comprehensive high schools.

[1] These are actual positions appearing in the budget adopted for 1967-68.

[2] Does not include librarians.

[3] Does not include visiting and attendance teachers or librarians. Does Include 215 department chairmen in English, social studies, mathematics, science, foreign languages and business. They would teach part-time and serve as chairman during the remainder of their time. As department chairmen are needed in other areas, this figure would probably increase.

[4] Visiting teachers designated as social workers in Staffing Data.

Table 2

Summary of Building Recommendations
1966-67 To 1974-75

The Division of Educational Facilities Planning has recommended the expenditure of $89,555,000 for new construction and renovation of school buildings. A breakdown of this total amount is as follows:

Middle School Construction	$42,000,000
High School Construction	15,500,000
Vocational School Construction	13,000,000
Building Rehabilitation	19,055,000
	$89,555,000

BASIC ASSUMPTIONS FOR PROJECTING EXPENDITURE ESTIMATES

The projected budget summaries which follow, reflecting estimated expenditures for the year 1974-75, have of necessity been based on many assumptions. It is emphasized again that if any of these basic assumptions prove to be erroneous, or should there be difficulty in realizing them by that time, the estimates should be correspondingly revised.

The most important basic assumptions upon which the 1974-75 cost estimates are projected, are as follows:

1. The decision reached by the Buffalo Board of Education to change to a K-4-4-4 educational plan will be accomplished.
2. The increased instructional staff recommended by the Bureaus of Elementary and Secondary Supervision will be provided.
3. The building program recommended by the Division of Educational Facilities Planning will be completed.
4. Both the additional staffing and the building program will commence during the year 1968-69. Approximately the same number of staff will be added each year, and approximately the same amount of construction will be accomplished each year until 1974-75 when all additional staff will have been provided and all construction will have been completed.
5. The high level of teacher turnover which presently exists in Buffalo will continue.
6. All additional teachers will be qualified for and appointed at the first step of the B.A.+30 salary schedule.
7. Buffalo will continue to provide transportation under its present policy, stipulating that pupils must live 1½ miles or more from school to be eligible for transportation. Private transportation will be utilized to provide any additional service required.

METHOD OF ESTIMATING EXPENDITURES

Plan "A"

The expenditure estimates for the school year 1974-75, identified as Plan "A", have been projected in the following manner:

1. Salaries

a. Salaries of associate and assistant superintendents have been projected in accordance with current schedules, including the upward adjustment made in June 1967.

b. Salaries of principals, assistant principals, supervisors and directors have been projected in accordance with present schedules.

c. Teachers' salaries have been projected on the basis of the current salary schedule, which provides for a beginning salary of $5,800. These projections reflect teacher turnover of twenty-five percent during the first year of employment and ten percent during each of the second through fifth years of employment. These turnover factors are based on past experience in the Buffalo City School District indicating that teacher turnover approximates sixty-five percent by the sixth year. It has been assumed that all teachers presently employed will remain at their present training level placements on the salary schedule. Projections for new teachers have been made on the assumption that their training would be thirty hours beyond a B.A. degree and that all would start at the first step.

d. Salaries and wages of non-instructional civil service employees have been adjusted to reflect the twelve percent increase granted for the 1967-68 year. This increase is also reflected in the salary schedule used in estimating the 1974-75 salaries. Additions to the non-instructional staff are based on the numbers that the district estimated would be necessary, and those the Division of Educational Management Services deemed essential to provide services required by the new construction. The district cost of retirement for non-instructional employees in the New York State Retirement System has been projected on the 1/60th plan at an annual rate of 16.2 percent of the appropriate salaries.

2. Transportation

Since no agreement has been reached as to the probable location of the proposed new buildings, it is not possible to accurately project the future transportation needs of the district.

Inasmuch as the projected enrollment does not change materially, and because the construction of additional buildings should reduce the number of pupils requiring transportation under the present mileage policy, it has been assumed that the amount budgeted for transportation in 1967-68 will be adequate for the year 1974-75.

Recognizing that Buffalo plans to replace buses after a life of ten years, this study reflects the cost of replacing two buses a year to fulfill this policy.

3. Debt Service

a. It has been assumed that the bond anticipation notes of 1966-67 in the amounts of $5,082,000 and $617,000 will be replaced by a bond issue in the amount of $5,699,000 to be issued in 1967-68 and amortized over a 15-year period at an interest rate of 3.5 percent.

b. With respect to the $6,000,000 of capital appropriations authorized for 1967-68, it has been assumed that a down payment of $300,000 will be made and the difference of $5,700,000 will be obtained through the issuance of a second 1967-68 bond issue amortized over 15 years with interest at 3.5 percent.

c. The cost of the recommended new construction and building rehabilitation in the amount of $89,555,000 is reflected as follows:

The district will make an annual down payment of $750,000 during the years 1968-69 through 1972-73 and $755,000 during 1973-74. In addition, during each of these six years, the district will issue bonds in the amount of $14,175,000 to be amortized over 15 years with interest at 3.5 percent.

4. Other Expenditure Estimates

a. The cost of office supplies, transportation of district personnel, and travel allowances remains the same as those originally proposed by the board of education for the year 1967-68.

b. Estimates for instructional supplies, textbooks and library books are also based on the Board of Education's initial requests for the 1967-68 school year, but these have been modified to reflect enrollment changes.

Plan "B"

At the request of the administration of the Buffalo City School District estimates reflecting increased costs because of inflation have been included for 1974-75. These are identified under Plan "B." This has been done by applying two indexes, both of which assume increases at the same rate during the period from 1967-68 to 1974-75, as the rate of increase during the period from 1960-61 to 1967-68. These indexes are as follows:

1. Salaries

All 1974-75 salary estimates under Plan "B" have been calculated by applying a 110 percent factor to all salary estimates contained in Plan "A." This 10 percent increase is based on the Consumer Price Index for Urban Wage Earners and Clerical Workers published by the United States Department of Labor.

2. All Other Expenditure Estimates (including Debt Service and Transportation)

All other expenditure estimates contained in Plan "B" have been determined by applying a 115.3 percent factor to all the non-salary estimates contained in Plan "A." This 15.3 percent increase is based on the Building Cost Index published monthly by the New York State Department of Labor.

Table 3

Summary of Budget Estimates for Education

Account	Title	1967-68 Budget	1974-75 Plan "A"	1974-75 Plan "B"
000	Board of Education	$92,946	94,171	105,435
100	Central Administration	743,305	806.654	893,474
200	Instruction-Regular Day School	32,581,067	40,474,090	44,564,641
300	Instruction-Special Schools	288,050	417,773	459,929
500	Transportation	2,203,066	2,203,066	2,550,000
600	Operation & Maintenance of Plant	7,230,668	8,061,109	9,098,820
700	Unallocated Charges	8,792,000	11,269,335	12,350,271
	Total Operating Budget Request	$51,931,102	$63,326,198	$70,022,570
	Exempt Items	560,000	949,000	1,093,500
	Debt Service	4,721,215	11,503,192	12,753,317
	Down Payment	300,000	--	—
	Grand Total	$57,512,317	$75,778,390	$83,869,887

Table 4

Budget Estimates Exempt Items

Account	Title	1967-68 Budget	1974-75 Plan "A"	1974-75 Plan "B"
220	Visual Instructional	$ —	95,000	109,500
220	Library Books	—	265,000	305,500
220	Public School Textbooks	350,000	432,000	498,000
220	Non Public School Textbooks	210,000	140,000	161,000
510	Busses	—	17,000	19,500
	Total Exempt Items	$560,000	949,000	1,093,500

Table 5

Comparison of Budget Allocations

Functional Unit	Board of Education	1967-68 Budget	1974-75 Plan "A"	1974-75 Plan "B"
010	Board of Education	$55,142	56,215	63,250
050	Audit	37,804	37,956	42,185
	Total Board of Education	$92,946	94,171	105,435
	Central Administration			
110	Chief School Administrator	$68,043	69,616	76,860
120	Instructional Services	32,677	34,759	38,290
130	Bureau of Budget Payrolls & Accounts	208,681	219,738	243,540
131	Purchase	88,908	95,760	105,610
140	Finance & Research	67,765	72,849	80,275
150	Division of Personnel	151,423	160,224	176,880
160	Public Relations	36,319	53,399	58,829
170	Curriculum & Evaluation	89,489	100,309	113,190
	Total Central Administration	$743,305	$806,654	$893,474
	Instruction Regular Day School			
211	Principals	$2,903,100	2,898,020	3,190,140
212	Supervision	780,880	921,620	1,015,891
220	Teaching	27,514,810	34,607,450	38,102,265
280	Co-Curricular Activities	100,400	114,200	128,390
281	Inter Scholastic Athletics	131,990	152,200	168,405
291	Guidance	624,220	994,720	1,094,200
292	Psychological Services	129,745	194,435	213,985
293	Attendance	395,822	591,345	651,265
294	Health Services	100	100	100
	Total Regular Day School	$32,580,967	$40,474,090	$44,564,641

Table 5 (con't.)

Comparison of Budget Allocations

Functional Unit	Instruction Special Schools	1967-68 Budget	1974-75 Plan "A"	1974-75 Plan "B"
311	Supervision-Principals	$25,532	39,962	44,019
312	Supervision-Others	22,700	23,511	25,930
320	Teaching	239,818	354,300	389,980
	Total Instruction Special Schools	$288,050	$417,773	$459,929
	Transportation			
510	Transportation	$2,118,463	2,118,463	2,437,500
530	Garage	84,603	84,603	112,500
	Total Transportation	$2,203,066	2,203,066	2,550,000
	Operation and Maintenance			
600	Salaries	$3,347,757	3,693,475	4,062,940
600	Supplies	630,910	728,704	840,200
600	Other Expenses	3,252,001	3,638,930	4,195,680
	Total Operation & Maintenance	$7,230,668	8,061,109	9,098,820
	Unallocated Charges			
710	Salaries	$26,627	29,938	32,940
	Supplies	6,000	6,000	6,715
	Printing	7,000	8,700	10,030
	Retirement & Social Security	7,189,271	9,543,783	10,362,492
	Insurance	909,000	1,025,914	1,182,879
	Municipal Services	655,000	655,000	755,215
	Total Unallocated Charges	$8,792,898	$11,269,335	$12,350,271

Table 6

Analysis of
Increases in Appropriations
1967-68 to 1974-75

	Cost Item	1974-75 Plan "A" Dollar Increase	1974-75 Plan "A" Percent of Total Increase	1974-75 Plan "B" Dollar Increase	1974-75 Plan "B" Percent of Total Increase
1.	Salaries	$8,434,207	46.2	$12,901,394	48.9
2.	Fringe Benefits	2,354,512	12.9	3,173,221	12.0
3.	Supplies, Equipment, Books, other Expenses including Exempt Items	392,842	2.2	885,339	3.4
4.	Transportation Service other than Salaries	-0-	-0-	346,339	1.3
5.	Operation & Maintenance other than Salaries	484,723	2.6	943,680	3.6
6.	Insurance & Municipal Services	116,914	.6	374,097	1.4
7.	Debt Service & Down Payment	6,481,977	35.5	7,732,602	29.4
	Total Increase	$18,265,175 (Approx. 32%)	100	$26,356,672 (Approx. 46%)	100

Table 7

Summary of Expenditures and Revenues

Expenditures	1967-68 Budget	1974-75 Plan "A"	1974-75 Plan "B"
Operation Expenses	$51,932,000	$63,326,198	$70,022,570
Exempt Items	560,000	949,000	1,093,500
Debt Service	4,721,215	11,503,192	12,753,817
Down Payment	300,000	--	--
Total Expenditures	$57,513,215	$75,778,390	$83,869,887
Revenues			
State Aid	$32,973,950	$48,533,226	$53,430,898
Non-Property Tax	4,300,000	4,000,000	4,000,000
Other Revenue	368,400	310,850	310,850
Real Property Tax	19,870,865	22,934,314	26,128,139
Total Revenue	$57,513,215	$75,778,390	$83,869,887
True Value for Tax Levy Purposes	$2,044,553,400	*1,749,600,000	*1,749,600,000
Required Tax Rate on True Value	9.72	13.11	$14.93
True Valuation for Tax Limit Purposes	2,117,927,600	1,820,396,160	1,820,396,160
Tax Rate on True Value Required for Tax Limit Purposes	$6.75	$5.76	$6.75

*Furnished by Division of Educational Finance.

NOTE: While the trend in real property tax base has been a declining one, it is reasonable to assume that major improvements in the Buffalo School System will encourage business and industrial development, resulting in a reversal of this trend.

SUMMARY OF PART III

To implement the staffing and building recommendations of the State Education Department will require a substantial increase in Buffalo City School District expenditures.

Under Plan "A," which assumes the continuation of current cost levels through the year 1974-75, this increase would be $18,265,175 or approximately 32%, going from a total budget of $57,513,215 to a total budget of $75,778,390. This means that a total estimated expenditure per child in weighted average daily attendance would increase over $250.00, from $785.67 in 1967-68 to $1,038.63 in 1974-75. During 1974-75, increases in revenue from other than real property taxes will offset $15,201,726 or approximately 83% of this increase. The remaining $3,063,449, or approximately 17%, required to meet the increase will need to be raised by real property taxes unless other sources of revenue become available.

The 1967-68 Buffalo City School budget requires an overall tax rate of $9.72 per $1,000 of true valuation. The expenditure estimates contained in Plan "A" would require a corresponding rate of $13.11 per $1,000 of true valuation. This increase in tax rate of $3.39 per $1,000 (about one-third) results both from the need for additional tax dollars and from the sharp drop in the tax base. By eliminating the excludable items from the tax levy, the tax rate required to meet expenditures subject to tax limitation would decrease from $6.75 per $1,000 of true valuation in 1967-68 to $5.76 in 1974-75. (The reason for this is that a large proportion of the increased expenditures is for purposes not subject to tax limit. At the same time, state aid is also increased because of these expenditures. These two factors combine to reduce the tax levy subject to tax limit.)

Under Plan "B," which reflects higher costs based on the assumption that recent inflationary trends will continue and increased state aid on the assumption that the allowable expenditure base will increase from $660 to $726 (10%) per W.A.D.A., a greater tax increase results.

Under this plan expenditures will increase from $57,513,215 to $83,869,887, a difference of $26,356,672 or approximately 46%. The total estimated expenditure per child in weighted average daily attendance would increase over $360.00, from $785.67 in 1967-68 to $1,149.53 in 1974-75. This plan seems the more realistic of the two, because all indications point to a continuation of inflationary factors.

State aid would increase from $32,973,950 to $53,430,898, a difference of $20,456,948. This results in an increase in the required overall tax rate on true valuation from $9.72 in 1967-68 to $14.93 (over one-half) in 1974-75. The tax rate required to meet expenditures subject to tax limitation would, however, remain at $6.75.

If the City of Buffalo can continue to expend the same percentage of its tax limit dollars that it did in 1967-68 for educational purposes, the Buffalo City School District should be able to operate under either Plan "A" or Plan "B." Either of these plans, however, would require an overall increase in taxes for school purposes unless other sources of revenue are found.

Suggestions concerning possible ways and means of meeting increased expenditures which will be required by the Buffalo City School District are discussed in the revenue section of this study.

PART IV

REVENUE FOR BUFFALO PUBLIC SCHOOLS

The Buffalo Public Schools face a revenue crisis. This situation is not new. Previous crises have been met, or partially met, and the system has survived. The present crisis promises to be even more severe because of the steadily increasing demands placed upon the educational system.

Buffalo's problems are similar to those of other large cities. Some of the problems, for example, the changing character of the population, are national in origin. Other problems are peculiarly State problems, for they relate to State Constitution limitations on the local ability to solve fiscal problems. Still others are regional in nature as the interrelationship between the city and the metropolitan area it serves continues to grow and become more complex. Finally, many problems are local in nature and relate to such things as priorities given to education and other city services.

Although the causes of the fiscal crisis are many, this report will concentrate on the three main causes for the fiscal crisis.

First, Buffalo is subject to a tax limit, and with or without far-reaching changes in the organization and operation of the school system, it appears that there simply will not be enough local money from present taxes to carry on an adequate educational program.

Second, the property tax base, long the mainstay of support for public education, is declining in size. This is contrary to the situation in the rest of the State and nation. The problem is not a decline, but the fact that the property tax base does not expand as rapidly as the economy. In addition, the revenue from the county sales tax may be expected to decline.

Third, the Buffalo Public Schools are facing the problem of revitalizing the central city or facing an economic and educational wasteland. A most important step in this revitalization is achieving a quality educational program through integration.

The purpose of this part of the study is to examine the present sources of revenue and their potential for the future. New sources of revenue taxes presently authorized by law and taxes and alternative governmental arrangements not now authorized, but which might be feasible in the future are also considered.

The Present Revenue Situation

Table 1 shows estimated major revenues for the school district, the city and the county. These funds are generated from present taxes and fees in the three units which directly and indirectly supply the local support of the schools. The portion of county local revenues attributed to the people of Buffalo is estimated by comparing the full value of the city to that of the county.

Table 1

BUFFALO AND ERIE COUNTY TOTAL REVENUE
1966-67[1]

Source	Buffalo		Erie County
	School	Municipal	
Real Estate Tax	$19,219,347	$34,574,261	$42,710,599
Sales Tax	4,500,000	5,300,000	5,128,690
Other Revenue[2]	318,500	10,020,596	8,023,273
Total Local Revenue	24,037,847	49,894,857	55,862,562[3]
State Aid	24,636,738	7,373,558	22,438,594
Federal Aid	70,000	194,000	19,980,111
Total Revenue	48,744,585	57,462,415	98,281,267

[1] Buffalo figures are from 1966-67 Buffalo City Budget; County figures are actual revenues for 1966 calendar year from Audit and Control.

[2] Excludes unappropriated surplus.

[3] City of Buffalo responsible for approximately 37.35 percent of this amount based on valuation of city to county.

Table 2

LOCAL REVENUE RAISED BY BUFFALO RESIDENTS

Source	Buffalo		Erie County	Total
	School	Municipal		
Total Local Revenue	$24,037,847	$49,894,857	$20,864,667	$94,797,371

Table 3

DISTRIBUTION OF LOCAL REVENUES*
AMONG CITY AND SCHOOL FUNCTIONS
1964-65

(millions)

	Total	City	School	School Percent
Albany	$ 15.7	$ 9.1	$ 6.6	42.1
Buffalo	64.1	43.3	20.8	32.4
Rochester	49.1	26.7	22.5	45.7
Syracuse	29.1	17.5	11.6	39.8
Yonkers	29.1	17.0	12.1	41.5
New York City	2,115.8	1,580.7	535.1	25.2

*Does not include revenues from city departments, special assessments, water or electric utility revenues.

Source: Special Report on Municipal Affairs; Municipal Fiscal Year Ending in 1965; Department of Audit and Control

Observations:

1. The schools are supported primarily by the real estate levy, the county sales tax and State aid, although Federal aid is increasing in importance.

2. The real estate levy for 1966-67 is $19.2 million and has slightly more than doubled in the past ten years.

3. The sales tax will raise an estimated $4.5 million for school support in 1966-67 and, despite many changes in the percentage collected and amount allocated to education, it has ranged between $4.3 and $4.8 million during the past ten years.

4. State aid is estimated at $24.6 million and has increased over 200 percent since 1955.

5. Federal aid is shown as $70 thousand. Actually, $8.9 million was allocated to Buffalo but only $70 thousand has been budgeted into the regular school program. The remainder is spent through a special Federal aid budget.

Table 2 points up the fact that of the more than $94 million of local revenue raised in the City of Buffalo for city and county purposes in 1966-67, only $24.0 million of this sum is allocated to education.

The complexities of certain inter-governmental arrangements in Buffalo can not be expressed in numerical data. For example, in addition to providing property tax revenue, the city also supports a number of activities which provide services to the schools and therefore are claimed by the city to represent school expenditures. These include audit and control, assessment, provision of central office space, recreation services, law, sanitation, fire, civil service and treasury service. The total expenditure for such services is approximately $650 thousand.

In addition, Erie County provides health service to the city schools which, after State health aid is deducted, costs the county $216 thousand. This cost is not borne by the city taxpayers alone, but by the entire county.

Five city functions have been taken over by Erie County. They include health, welfare, hospital, probation and library. The five functions comprise 62 percent of the county budget.

The city revenues allocated to schools represented 32.5 percent of the total city local revenue in 1966-67. If, as noted above, county revenues are also considered the percentage closely resembles that of New York City, which devotes the lowest percentage of any of the Big Six to schools. Comparative figures for the latest year available for all Big Six Cities are shown in Table 3.

SPECIAL NOTE: Approximately 50 percent of revenues for education in Buffalo come from State aid; for municipal purposes 11 percent. If State aid for municipal support were 50 percent, approximately $28.7 million of local funds could be released for education.

Comparisons of effort among the Big Six cities are difficult because taxes available differ, the division of functions between city and county vary and needs for services are different. However, a rough comparison is possible if all taxes levied are converted to property tax equivalents. Table 5 shows such a conversion. Buffalo taxes for school purposes are the lowest of the Big Six. For municipal purposes they are in the middle, third from highest. The combined rate is also in the middle, third from highest. Table 5 indicates that Buffalo puts a considerably higher priority on municipal services than on school services.

The effect of this relatively small proportion of city revenue devoted to public schools is shown in Table 6. Buffalo has had the lowest operating expenditure per pupil of any of the Big Six cities in each of the last five years. Despite a substantial increase in operating expenditure in 1966-67 it remained the lowest, an estimated $72 below Albany, the next city in expenditure. Furthermore, the percent of increase from 1961-62 to 1966-67 was the second lowest of the Big Six.

Property taxes. The local mainstay of Buffalo City expenditures is the property tax. Despite a Constitutional two percent operating levy limitation, the tax produced almost $54 million in 1966-67.

Table 4 offers a number of facts relative to property taxation in the City of Buffalo. Column 1 traces five-year average full valuation since 1960-61. The five-year average full valuation reached its highest point in 1965-66 and has declined since. This decline has been accentuated by a change in equalization rates effective in 1966. It would appear likely that the decline will continue for the next several years since the one-year valuation figures have declined steadliy since 1963, in an amount totaling $120 million.

The effect of the decline is to decrease the amount which can be raised under the two percent limitation. As shown in Column 2, almost $54 million was raised in 1966-67, but only $42 million was operating levy. This is due to the fact that net debt service may be carried outside the two percent limitation. Note in Column 5, that in 1966-67 the city operated within $452 thousand of the tax limit. If the same tax is levied in 1967-68 as was levied in 1966-67 the city will be within $31 thousand of legal limit. Note that in 1965-66 the tax limit was almost $1 million higher.

An examination of Table 4 not only suggests that there is no leeway for raising additional operating expenditure funds through the property tax levy, but that increasingly larger amounts will have to be raised from other sources to make up for the decreased revenue available from property tax sources in the future.

Some small temporary relief may be possible if a few items were shifted from current operating expense to debt service, which is not subject to the two percent limit. For example, the 1967-68 school operating budget contains a $124,000 amount for textbooks which could be transferred to debt service.

Table 5 presents full value property tax rates for school and nonschool purposes in the eight largest cities of New York State for 1965.

Table 6 presents the approved operating expenditures per pupil in weighted average daily attendance for the "Big Six Cities," 1961-1966.

Table 4

CITY OF BUFFALO
PROPERTY TAX LEEWAY[1]
1955-1968

Year	(1) Five-Year Average Full Valuation	(2) Real Estate Tax Levy	(3) Operating Tax Levy Subject to Tax Limit	(4) Tax Limit	(5) Tax Margin	(6) Operating Levy as Percent of Five-Year Average on Full Valuation
1954-55	$1,186,700,550	$33,060,267	$23,715,902	$23,734,011	$ 18,109	1.998
1960-61	1,830,956,750	48,311,470	36,589,689	36,619,135	29,446	1.998
1961-62	1,923,615,800	47,426,165	38,445,562	38,472,316	26,754	1.998
1962-63	2,082,212,900	46,761,438	35,996,743	41,644,258	5,647,515	1.728
1963-64	2,082,206,050	50,809,702	41,375,520	41,644,121	268,601	1.987
1964-65	2,157,841,500	50,547,908	41,203,975	43,156,830	1,952,855	1.91
1965-66	2,166,656,850	50,202,105	39,210,084	43,333,137	4,123,053	1.81
1966-67	2,139,016,250	53,793,608	42,327,886	42,780,325	452,439	1.978
1967-68	2,117,928,016			42,358,560		

---

[1] Source: Published and preliminary figures from Audit and Control.

Table 5

FULL VALUE PROPERTY TAX RATES*
FOR SCHOOL AND NON SCHOOL PURPOSES
IN THE EIGHT LARGEST CITIES
NEW YORK STATE, 1965

City	School Purposes			Non School Purposes			All Purposes		
	Property	Non Property	Total	Property	Non Property	Total	Property	Non Property	Total
Albany	10.58	----	10.58	19.27	1.36	20.63	29.85	1.36	31.25
Buffalo	8.19	2.18	10.37	21.98	4.92	26.90	30.17	7.10	37.27
Rochester	11.23	2.12	13.35	19.37	7.81	27.18	30.60	9.93	40.53
Syracuse	11.26	----	11.26	22.16	3.50	25.66	33.42	3.50	36.92
Yonkers	11.18	----	11.18	17.47	1.61	19.08	28.65	1.61	30.26
New York City	14.68	----	14.68	20.34	17.82	38.16	35.02	17.82	52.84
Niagara Falls	13.49	0.62	14.11	19.37	7.81	27.18	32.86	8.43	41.29
Utica	10.54	1.10	11.64	27.25	0.42	27.67	37.79	1.52	39.31

*Tax rates were computed on the basis of tax levies made during the fiscal year ending in 1966 and estimated full value of taxable real property based on assessment rolls completed in calendar year 1965. In the case of Utica, the tax levy is for fiscal year 1964-65.

Non-property tax rates shown are the property tax rate equivalent of the non property levies.

The estimated portion of the county tax levy paid by residents of the city is included in the figures shown.

Source: Bureau of Education Finance Research

Table 6

"BIG SIX CITIES"

APPROVED OPERATING EXPENDITURES PER PUPIL IN WEIGHTED AVERAGE DAILY ATTENDANCE

	1961-62	1962-63	1963-64	1964-65	1965-66	Estimated* 1966-67	Percent Increase 1961-62 to 1965-66	Percent Increase 1961-62 to 1966-67
New York City	$538	$611	$650	$712	$784	$835	45.7	55.2
Albany	501	566	567	615	647	666	29.1	32.9
Buffalo	450	442	457	491	511	594	13.6	32.0
Rochester	597	634	649	700	785	832	31.5	39.4
Syracuse	525	519	520	557	609	675	16.0	28.6
Yonkers	447	482	527	551	624	668	39.6	49.4
Statewide Average	547	590	621	669	716	760	30.9	38.9

*Bureau of Educational Finance Research

Source: Bureau of Education Finance Research

Sales tax. Erie County was the first county to adopt a sales and use tax and has been the only county which has made a specific allocation of a portion of the tax to education.

The present allocation is 43.5 percent of a 2 percent sales tax. This amount is allocated to education on a countywide basis. The funds are distributed to school districts within the county on a per pupil basis. Since the number of pupils in Buffalo remains relatively stable while the number outside the city grows, the growth in yield from the tax has not resulted in a correspondingly increasing yield for the schools of the city. Table 7 shoes the revenues from this tax.

Table 7

SALES TAX REVENUES FOR EDUCATION - BUFFALO

Year	Amount
1960-61	$4,441,000
1961-62	4,341,000
1962-63	4,277,000
1963-64	4,536,000
1964-65	4,783,000
1965-66	5,068,000*
1966-67	4,500,000**
1967-68	4,500,000***

*14 months return
**Estimate - Erie County
***Estimate - Division of Educational Finance

Source: Division of Finance and Research, Board of Education, Buffalo, N.Y. (Rounded to the nearest thousand)

"The Erie County Sales Tax was in effect from 1947 to 1964 at the rate of 1%--all of which was for education. In July 1964 the rate was increased to 2%. Of the additional 2%, only .05 was allotted for education. School districts received 1.05% and the balance of 1.95% was distributed to Erie County and the cities, towns and villages in the county.[1]

"Effective August 1, 1965, New York State enacted a statewide sales tax at 2%. At the same time Erie County reduced the county sales tax from 3% to 2% on the same broadened coverage as the State.

"The Erie County sales tax money at the new rate of 2% is distributed as follows: 43.5% for schools; 38.5% cities, towns and villages; and 18% to Erie County.

[1] SOURCE: "Revenues and Resources of the Board of Education;" Division of Finance and Research, Board of Education, Buffalo, New York. January, 1966.

> "The 43.5% portion of the sales tax is distributed strictly on a per pupil basis to school districts in which the pupils reside regardless of where these pupils attend school. The tax collected for school districts is merely divided by the last full year's average daily attendance of all pupils residing in the county to get a per pupil amount.
>
> "The per pupil rate fluctuates depending on the amount collected and the number of pupils. The highest rate--$82.31--was paid in 1956-57 and the lowest rate in recent years was $66.50 in 1962-63. We received $70.98 per pupil in 1964-65.
>
> "Percentagewise, Buffalo's share has been dropping steadily since the first year (1947-48)--from 61.6 to a low of 37.5 in 1964-65--the chief reason being that Erie County outside Buffalo has had a very rapid increase in pupil attendance, actually 78,020 pupils from 1948 to 1966, or an increase of 200%.
>
> "In contrast, Buffalo's pupil attendance descreased for many years. While there has been an increase of nearly 11,000 pupils since 1953-54, or 19%, the net increase over the 18-year period 1948-1966 is only 8%.
>
> "In comparison with Buffalo's increase of 10,837 pupils in the past 12 years, the rest of the county has increased 61,467 in the same period. This continuing trend of much more rapid growth outside Buffalo makes it obvious that Buffalo's share of the sales tax will continue to decrease in the years ahead."

It is likely that the sales tax will play a decreasing role in school support. Only an increase in the sales tax rate locally with a substantial portion going to education could reverse the downward trend. The estimated per pupil amount from this tax in 1967-68 is approximately $58.66. This is the lowest amount per pupil in recent years. It is less than 10 percent of the estimated operating expenditure per pupil. In the previous low year, 1965-66, the amount was $64.70. This was 12 percent of the operating expenditure per pupil.

From the foregoing it is possible to conclude that:

1. under present sales tax rates, revenues for school purposes from the sales tax will not increase and;

2. revenue from other sources will be necessary to make up any increases in the cost of education.

State Aid to Education. State aid to education consists of three major components: (1) operating expense aid, to which for Buffalo is added a 17.5 percent size correction; (2) building aid; (3) and transportation aid. There are, in addition, some minor categorical aids. These, with few exceptions, are normally based on some type of matching, so that while they may increase aid, they also increase local expenditure. The exception is textbook aid, which was established in 1966-67. For textbook aid the State pays a flat sum, up to $15 per pupil in grades 7-12, for reimbursement of the purchase of approved textbooks. This is paid for both public and private school pupils.

Table 8 shows the State aid paid or estimated to be paid. State aid for education paid to Buffalo has increased rapidly since 1961, which is due to several factors, all of which are likely to continue.

First, the ceiling for aid to education has been raised several times by the Legislature. In 1962, it was set at $500 per pupil; it is now $660 per pupil.

Second, per pupil valuation in Buffalo has been decreasing. The high point in full value of property in Buffalo was in 1961 when total full value stood at $2,198,000. In 1967 it was $2,047,000. Over the past dozen years the number of students in the public schools has shown an increase, but the increase now appears to have leveled off.

Third, the average valuation per pupil Statewide has increased, while the per pupil valuation in Buffalo has decreased.

The result is an aid ratio which has moved from .379 in 1962-63 to .538 in 1967-68. The change in the aid ratio affects both the proportion of operating aid and the proportion of building aid. Transportation aid, in Buffalo, is aided at a flat 90 percent of approved expense.

Table 8

State Aid -- Buffalo

Year	Amount	Aid Ratio
1960-61	$12,450,000	----
1961-62	13,118,000	----
1962-63	14,816,000	.379
1963-64	16,885,000	.438
1964-65	19,324,000	.452
1965-66	20,443,000	.482
1966-67	26,739,175	.495
1967-68	32,600,000*	.538

*Estimate - Division of Educational Finance
SOURCE: Bureau of Educational Finance Research

Note that State aid is expected to increase to $32,600,000 in 1967-68, an increase of $5,860,825 over the previous year, and of $12.2 million over 1965-66. The increase for 1967-68 is not automatic, since it requires action by Buffalo. It presumes, among other things, two important conditions which may be difficult to accomplish. One is the maintenance of the $11 per thousand tax rate for education achieved this year, which is the mandated rate below which no district may fall without incurring a State aid penalty. The second is that Buffalo will be able to increase local expenditure from $594 to $636 per pupil for operating expense, which is a 7 percent increase in operating expense, the maximum in which the State will share on a current basis. This requires $1,420,000 for the local share of the 7 percent increase in expenditure. Actually, it now appears that the expenditure level will be well in excess of $636 per pupil for next year.

Federal Aid. Federal aid to education has increased greatly, especially beginning in 1965-66. Buffalo schools receive aid from some dozen different programs which range from prekindergarten education to adult retraining programs.

The purpose of these programs will not be discussed here. It is important, however, to be aware that each program has a highly specific purpose and hence does not provide funds which can be used to finance existing general purpose programs. It is also important to note that each of these programs can provide both equipment and personnel within the limits of the stated objectives of the Federal aid. It is only in the sense that any of these programs represent the development or expansion of a program which otherwise would have been attempted with local funds that it represents any relief of the local tax burden. Each contains specific maintenance of effort provisions.

Table 9 shows the major components of Federal aid allocated to the Buffalo schools for the years 1964-65, 1965-66 and 1966-67.

Of the $9,284,500 allocated for 1965-66, only $3,773,000 was paid in the year ending June 30. Most of the remainder will be paid at a later date. That over 33,000 students were involved in programs funded under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act, provides an indication of the impact of that legislation. Thirty-four public schools operated programs and twenty-six private schools were assisted. Two hundred twenty-seven teacher aides were added to the inner-city schools, 2,031 public school teachers and 60 private school teachers were involved in programs; over 200,000 books were added to the libraries and needed supplies and equipment for programs were made available.

Programs made possible by ESEA include remedial programs, teacher assistance, preschool classes, cultural enrichment and library improvement. A cooperative "demonstrative center for teachers of mentally retarded children" has also been developed by Buffalo and neighboring schools.

Although the amount of Federal aid is large, there is little likelihood that Federal funds will be available in the near future to expand or maintain existing school services. Since present Federal aid is categorical aid it can be used only for the purpose authorized, usually new and/or additional programs.

Leeway Under Present Revenue Authorizations

Any leeway in local funds which can be used for the expansion of governmental services under present authorizations must come from the property tax, the sales tax, the utility tax or one of the several taxes now authorized, but not levied. These include the additional 1 percent sales tax, the liquor sales privilege, the motor vehicle use tax, and the coin-operated amusement device tax, (see Table 11).

Table 9

FEDERAL AID ALLOCATIONS

Program	1964-65	1965-66	1966-67
Elementary and Secondary Education Act			
Title I	--	$5,292,000	$4,933,000
Title II	--	200,000	200,000
School Lunch	$ 64,000	73,000	104,000
School Milk	178,000	166,000	142,000
National Defense Education Act			
Title III	10,000	26,000	10,000
Title V	31,500	41,500	41,500
Smith-Hughes*	69,000	69,000	69,000
Vocational Education 4-a	355,000	433,000	433,000
Work Study	9,000	--	--
MDT	279,000	2,576,000	2,576,000
EOA II-B	--	247,000	247,000
Welfare Education Program	192,000	161,000	161,000
	$1,187,500	$9,284,500	$8,916,500

*Contained in the school budget and city budget
SOURCE: Bureau of Educational Finance Research

Table 10

AUTHORIZED LOCAL NONPROPERTY TAXES IN NEW YORK STATE FOR CITIES OF 125,000 AND OVER 1/

City	NONPROPERTY										
	Utility Company Income	Harness Race Admissions	Coin-Operated Amusement Devices	Liquor Sales Privilege	Motor Vehicle Use	Retail Sales and Compensation Use	Consumers Utility	Services and Compensating Use	Restaurant Meals	Hotel Room Occupancy	Amusement Admissions and Club Dues
Albany	X						X				
Buffalo 2/	X	*				*	X	*	*	*	*
New York City 3/	X		X			X	X	X	X	X	X
Rochester 4/	X					*	*	*	*	*	*
Syracuse 5/	X					X	X	X	X	X	X
Yonkers	X	X									

KEY - X indicates tax is imposed by City
*Imposed at County Level but City received a portion of the revenue from the tax.

1/A Tax on (1) Tickets of Admission, (2) Telephone Possession, (3) Occupancy, (4) Patent Medicine, (5) Tobacco; other than cigarette, and (6) Vending Machines, may also be imposed but only for subsidizing housing.

2/Buffalo receives revenue from county taxes for school purposes as well as municipal purposes.

3/New York City imposes an occupancy tax, including tax on vending machines in the premises, cigarette tax, flat race, admission tax, commercial motor vehicle tax, vault tax, commercial rent tax, real property transfer tax, business tax package, city personal income tax on residents, and earnings tax on nonresidents in addition to those indicated above.

4/Portion of sales tax from Monroe County is used for education in City of Rochester.

5/Sales tax revenue is not used for school purposes.

Source: Bureau of Statistical Services, Department of Audit and Control

Only two taxes have any likelihood of possible use in supplying more local revenue. An increase of 1 percent in the sales tax would supply over $2 million for education as shown in Table 11 and the levy of a liquor sales privilege tax would provide an added $144,400 for education, as well as more funds for municipal purposes. The motor vehicle tax is difficult to collect and the limited revenue from the coin-operated amusement device tax makes the expense of collection prohibitive.

It is clear that presently authorized taxes will not provide the financing needed for education in Buffalo. The Buffalo school system needs large amounts of money to reduce class size, make teacher salaries more attractive, improve the provision of teaching materials, upgrade maintenance and provide needed buildings.

Table 10 shows the local nonproperty taxes Buffalo is authorized to use and Table 11 presents estimates of additional revenues available under present authorizations. If the tax is not feasible no revenue has been indicated.

State aid does provide a source of additional funds which can be used for general school purposes. Thus from existing sources of revenue the only probable source of increased funds is likely to be State aid to education.

The increased fiscal demands for services for Buffalo can be realized when the 1966-67 budget of $107.6 million is compared to the 1964-65 budget of $88.9 million. It appears certain that the city will have to levy additional authorized taxes and seek new authorizations of taxation in the very near future. This will be necessary just to meet the demand of normal growth of programs. New programs requiring additional funds will present demands for broader authorizations.

Table 11

AUTHORIZED AND ALTERNATIVE TAXES
POSSIBLE ADDITIONAL REVENUE FOR EDUCATION

Tax	Estimated Additional Revenue
Property	None
Sales Tax Increase to 3%	
Levied by County	$2,268,000*
Levied by City	2,388,000*
Liquor Sales Privilege	144,400*
Auto	None
Coin-Operated Amusement Devices	None
Tax Limit Increase to 2.5%	$3,400,000**
Countywide Surtax on Property	5,100,000**
Personal Income Tax	2,300,000**

*The amounts given are arrived at by applying the present split between the city and the schools for each of the new taxes.

**Alternative taxes.

The Adequacy of Projected Revenues

In an effort to determine the adequacy of future revenue sources, educational costs have been projected for the year 1974-75 by the Division of Educational Management Services of the State Education Department.

The projection shows a cost in 1974-75 of $83,869,887.* This figure reflects improved staffing plus salary increases of 10 percent based on a projection of the "United States Department of Labor, Consumer Price Index for Urban Wage Owners and Clerical Workers" and a projection of the "New York State Labor Department Cost of Building Index" in determining cost of anticipated building and alterations.

Revenues have likewise been projected to 1974-75. General increases in operational costs tend to be matched by corresponding increases in State aid. Therefore, the projected aid ceiling has been increased by 10 percent to $726 per pupil. Since it is probable that if State aid is increased, local effort requirements necessary to receive aid will also be increased, a 12 mill per $1,000 full value local effort rate has been projected. Also used were the present sharing of nonproperty taxes, the continuation of the 20 mill tax limit and a projection of the declining property tax base. Federal aid has been largely ignored. The projected number of pupils for this study has been used. Changes in economic conditions or priorities accorded public needs have not been assumed.

Table 12 shows projections of revenues to 1974-75. Operating expense aid shows an increase of almost $17 million largely due to increases in the State aid ceiling, the aid ratio and local expenditure. Lottery aid has been included in 1974-75 projections, based on operating expense aid. Building aid increases markedly due to new buildings projected. Size correction aid increases at the same rate as operating expense aid once the district reaches the State aid ceiling. Transportation increases considerably. Special aids (Textbook, Educational TV and Racial Imbalance) are projected at their approximate current or 1967-68 anticipated figures.

Local sources of revenue decrease 1.3 million despite the inclusion of a 12 mill rather than 11 mill local effort. The property tax decrease is due to declining full valuation while the nonproperty tax decrease is due to the relationship of the numbers of children in the city to those in the county. Finally, other revenue, which in this instance is largely nonresident tuition, is shown to decline.

---

* Plan B, estimated expenditures 1974-75, as determined by the Division of School Business Management.

Table 12

PROJECTED EDUCATIONAL REVENUE COMPARISON
BUFFALO SCHOOL SYSTEM

Source	1966-67	1974-75	% Change
State Aid For:			
Approved Operating Expense	$18,521,687	$35,565,869	92.0
Lottery (2%)	-----	711,317	--------
Budget	1,268,847	-----	-100.0
Building	1,989,261	7,713,509[1]	287.7
Size Correction	3,463,344	6,224,027	79.7[2]
Transportation	747,347	2,040,000	173.0
Textbook	627,999	418,876	- 33.3
Program ABLE	8,640	-----	-100.0
Educational TV	7,300	7,300	0.0
Racial Imbalance	104,750	750,000	616.0
Total State Aid	26,739,175[3]	53,430,898	99.8
Property Tax	19,219,347	18,388,400	- 4.3
Non-Property Tax	4,500,000	4,000,000	- 11.1
Other [Tuition and Misc.]	318,500	310,856	- 2.4
Total Revenue	50,777,022	76,130,154	49.9

---

[1] Based on Plan B cost, predicted by Division of Educational Management Services.

[2] Percentage will be same as for approved operating expense aid when approved operating expenses reach ceiling (assumed at $726).

[3] Differs from total presented in previous tables which showed a budget estimate while this total shows actual aid paid to Buffalo.

SOURCE: Bureau of Educational Finance Research

Projections indicate the total revenue for education will increase slightly more than 50 percent by 1974-75 while the expenditures will increase about 61 percent. It should be pointed out, however, that Buffalo probably could not allocate sufficient tax revenue to education to meet a 12 mill local effort requirement without having the present 2 percent tax limit on approved operating expenditures either raised or removed. The gap in 1974-75 between anticipated expenditures and anticipated revenue is $7.4 million, assuming a 10 percent increase in State aid and a 12 mill local effort requirement. Under the existing State aid ceiling of $660 per pupil for approved operating expenditures and 11 mill per $1,000 full value local effort requirement, the gap between anticipated revenues and expenditures in 1974-75 would be $13.4 million.

For years the Buffalo school system has been forced to try a wide variety of expedients in order to meet budgetary needs. The present analysis indicates that even the expedients are now in short supply. The gaps between anticipated expenditure and anticipated revenue undoubtedly underestimate the seriousness of the dilemma in which the Buffalo schools will shortly be found. Costs of education can be expected to increase if they follow past trends, while available revenue will not increase unless laws are changed and new sources of revenue explored. Adequate sources of revenue must be found if the schools are to be able to meet the crises which lie ahead in the form of militant teacher bargaining, integration, or even the daily problem of maintaining a school system adequate to support viable city life.

Possible New Revenue Sources

There are a variety of new sources of revenue for Buffalo schools which have been the subject of legislative proposal, or which have been advocated locally. They fall under three main headings: (1) increases in taxes requiring legislation; (2) increased State aid from a variety of plans; (3) further development of a metroploitan type of government.

Sources Requiring Legislative Authorization

The increases in taxes requiring legislation include three approaches:

1. to raise the tax limit
2. to apply a countywide surtax on property
3. to levy a city income tax.

Many authorities have urged that the 2 percent tax limitation be adjusted to compare to other cities, since no cities other than the Big Six labor under such severe property limitations. To do this would, of course, require an amendment to the Constitution. Also, it must be remembered that a vote was taken statewide to amend the Constitution to allow Buffalo schools fiscal independence and a city tax limit of 2.5 percent at the option of local residents. The vote statewide defeated the proposition: 1,996,000 against, to 1,505,000 for. Even in Erie County the vote was 172,000 against, to 74,000 for. The blank or void votes could easily have turned defeat into victory. They numbered 2,659,000 statewide and 153,000 in Erie County.

It would appear that if an authorization of added taxing power is necessary, as appears inevitable in the next several years, than an extension of the limit to 2.5 percent as provided in the defeated Proposition 9 makes good sense quite apart from the issue of fiscal independence. Of course, a very good case could be made for removing the limit entirely. The resulting revenue, if the entire 0.5 percent were levied in the coming year, would be $10 million. On the basis of past practice approximately $3.4 million of this sum would be available to the schools.

Applying a countywide surtax on property would have the effect of making tax burdens throughout the county somewhat more equal. At the present time certain communities are able to operate all services on a very low tax rate because of high valuation, usually the result of a concentration of industrial or commercial property. The proposal that a surtax of 2½ mills or some similar amount be applied on a county basis and the proceeds distributed to relieve the local tax base and equalize educational opportunity has merit. However, the idea is new and the amount of discussion required to gain acceptance would appear to make an immediate usefulness remote. However, the amount of money that could be raised by such a tax would be most helpful. It is approximately $14 million. If this were distributed back to school districts on a per pupil basis the City schools would receive $5.1 million. Both from the point of view of equity and from the point of view of providing needed revenue, this proposal deserves serious consideration.

The personal income tax is another tax which has been used at the city level to provide needed revenue. The most extensive use has been in Pennsylvania, Ohio and Kentucky. It has been used in several other states in a few instances. In 1966 the tax was authorized by the New York State Legislature for use by New York City. After extensive discussion the authorization was extended to include non-residents whose income is acquired within the city, but the authorization was at a considerably lower rate than that applied to residents. Contrary to other city income taxes the tax is progressive up to 2% on incomes over $30,000 although the progressive feature is much less pronounced for nonresidents.

A form of personal income tax may be considered when new forms of revenue for Buffalo are being discussed, since it would raise a large amount of money. Obviously, the imposition of such a tax would have great implications, not only for the city, but also for the county. Applying knowledge gained from the experiences of Buffalo, while allowing for lower levels of income, it is estimated that the income tax might raise as much as $6.4 million of which an estimated $2.3 million* might be available for the educational budget.

State aid to education. State aid to education for the City of Buffalo has undergone a 60 percent increase in the past two years, an increase large in amount and in proportion. Concurrently, Federal aid has also increased.

Two proposals made by the Board of Regents to the New York State Legislature would have proved helpful to Buffalo had they been passed. The first was to raise the ceiling of State per pupil expenditure to $726 per pupil. Since Buffalo is now below the present $660 this is not immediately useful, but coupled with a current budget provision it will mean that the strong flow of State aid to Buffalo would be continued over several more years. It does at the same time require increased local effort for education on the part of the city.

*Based on proportion of property taxes for education to total property tax.

A second proposal by the Regents was for $25 million statewide to be used to upgrade instruction for children who have not attained minimum educational competence as demonstrated on statewide tests. Buffalo would have benefited by something over $1 million from this proposal.

The Big Six have advocated in 1967 that the so-called "size correction" be increased by 9 percent, which would add $2.25 million to Buffalo's aid. While a strong case can be made for increased aid for cities, the purpose of the size correction has been too vague and imprecise to be useful in State aid planning.

The Big Six have also made a strong plea for more aid because of the large amounts of the more expensive special education which they provide. For many years large cities have been organized to provide special education. In recent years the State has encouraged the extension of special education by supplying generous aid, which is available to all districts, except the Big Six. An anomalous situation has developed in which Erie County school systems are encouraged to provide special education by an aid formula in which Buffalo cannot participate, although the effort to provide such special services has been made for many years. However, because of their comparatively low cost of vocational education, the below ceiling level of expenditure, and the low education tax rate, Buffalo would make only minor gains if BOCES aid provisions were extended to the city schools.

If special education pupils were weighted as is now done with the high school weighting, Buffalo would be helped. The exact effect of such a change would depend on the level of weighting used.

Metropolitan Government. An approach to big city problems which has been widely discussed and which is increasingly advocated is that of establishing a form of metropolitan government in which those who live and work in an area support the local governmental which benefits them.

> The growth of metropolitan communities is the natural end product of over a century of industrialization accompanied by increased agricultural productivity. Among the major forces working in this process were the changing technology (the automobile, the septic tank, the elevator, the powerpump, modern communication devices), the economics of mass housing, the lack of room in the central city and older suburbs, government housing policies and the search for individual homes surrounded by acreage. The resultant congestion and sprawl of the urban population and the interdependence of communities within the metropolitan areas have made it increasingly difficult for local governments to deal with many functions on less than an areawide basis. These functions usually include the provision of governmental service and controls in the fields of mass transportation and traffic, water supply and distribution, the disposal of sewage and other wastes, land-use planning and control, air pollution control, open space acquisition and management, and civil defense. The number and type of these functions which constitute metropolitan problems vary from place to place.

> A concern for equality of educational opportunity and the most efficient planning for the provision of educational services and facilities has also been a major motivating force in moves toward metropolitan organization.*

Metropolitan organization has taken several different forms of which the most widespread is the city-county consolidation. New York City which has been consolidated since 1898 is an outstanding example of such organization. The eighteen major reorganization efforts between 1950-60 were all defeated indicating that local approval for such plans is not easily come by.

Other modifications of metropolitan government exist in the form of the federation plan, of which Toronto is an example, and the metropolitan corporation exemplified by Winnipeg. Neither was created by the vote of the local population.

Buffalo and Erie County are already moving in the direction of a metropolitan approach to municipal and school problems as is evidenced by the imposition of the countywide sales tax for the support of education. In addition, the county has assumed a number of city functions such as health and countywide planning for highways. Other steps under discussion are a countywide system of parks, police force and fire department. Countywide thinking in regard to education is necessary to avoid costly duplication of facilities and services. The effective combination of efficient units with a maximum of local control is desirable.

It is unlikely that any such action will be immediate, but as new patterns of local taxation are discussed, some regional organization will be needed in the future or the conditions in the city may well deteriorate further.

Conclusion

Revenue for education in Buffalo is not now adequate to meet the needs of the children and the situation is likely to get worse in the future.

The additional revenue available under taxes now authorized is not great. Furthermore, large new taxes levied within the city alone can only contribute to causing a further exodus of business, industry and residents.

What is needed is a combination of city, metropolitan area, State and Federal funding which will provide sufficient revenue to meet the city's problems. The city can contribute to the process and the metropolitan area should be involved. The State must continue to increase its aid and the Federal Government must play a larger role in the financing of education. Only by such mutual efforts can city schools systems like Buffalo keep from falling deeper into the morass of financial inadequacy.

*The Advisory Committee on Inter-Governmental Relations. Governmental Structure, Organization and Planning in Metropolitan Areas, United States Government Printing Office, Washington, 1961.